



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

**SOUTH
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
REVISED APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of December 3, 2010**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Revision: A correction was made and is reflected in the first item (a) listed under Comments for Item # 12 10BAR-00000-00165 CalProp I, LLC Residential Partial Demolitions/Additions and Guest House Remodel.

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Will Rivera, at 9:00 A.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Will Rivera	Chair
Jeremy Roberts	Vice Chair
Martha Gray	
Glen Morris	
Steve Willson	
Jeff Yardy	
Lane Goodkind	
Anita Hodosy-McFaul	
Anne Almy	Supervising Planner

SBAR Secretary

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: Everyone present.

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 15±

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Rivera moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Gray and Morris absent) to:

- Continue Item #1 10 BAR-00000-00161 Frost Agriculture Barn to the meeting of December 17, 2010 at the request of the applicant.
- Continue Item #10 10BAR-00000-00147 Rothbard Revised Landscape t the meeting of December 17, 2010 at the request of the applicant.

III. MINUTES: Roberts moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Gray absent) to approve the Minutes of November 19, 2010.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 10BAR-00000-00119 Jesusita Graf Rebuild Two Story Residence Mission Canyon
10LUP-00000-00308 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Mission**
Request of Thomas C. McMahan, agent for the owner, Klaus Graf, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00119 for **final approval on consent of a new two story residence of approximately 2,162 square feet and attached garage of approximately 462 square feet.** The following structure existed on the parcel: original residence of approximately 900 square feet (destroyed by Jesuita Fire.) The proposed project will require approximately 140 cubic yards of cut and approximately 40 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .26 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-112-015, located at **2626 Montrose Place** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/20/10, 9/17/10, 10/15/10, 11/05/10 & 11/19/10)

ACTION: Rivera moved, seconded by Roberts and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Gray absent) to grant final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00119.

**C-2. 10BAR-00000-00159 Cabugos Garage Conversion Santa Barbara
10LUP-00000-00422 (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta**

Request of Joaquin Ornelas, agent for the owners, Nick and Carolyn Cabugos, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00159 for **final approval on consent of a garage conversion of approximately 445 square feet.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,367 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 6,800 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 065-192-004, located at **4759 Andrita Street** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/10)

ACTION: Rivera moved, seconded by Roberts and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Gray absent) to grant final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00159.

V. SBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: None.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None

VII. STANDARD AGENDA:

Isla Vista/Goleta

**1. 10BAR-00000-00161 Frost Agricultural Barn Santa Barbara
08LUP-00000-00714 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ridgeline**

Request of Kevin Frost, owner, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00161 for **preliminary/final approval of an agricultural barn of approximately 2,100 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a barn of approximately 900 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 200 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 10 acre parcel zoned MTN.GOL 100 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 153-300-013, located at **2013 N. San Marcos Road** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/10)

ACTION: Rivera moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Gray absent) to continue 10BAR-00000-00161 to the meeting of December 17, 2010 at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

**2. 10BAR-00000-00061 Essex Property Trust Monument Sign Isla Vista
10CUP-00000-00011 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Coastal**

Request of Tracy Parker, Wolfpack Sign Group, agent for the owner, Essex Property Trust, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00061 for **further conceptual review of one monument sign of approximately 31.34 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Housing Apartments. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.39 acre parcel zoned SR-H20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 075-010-024, located at **6721 El Colegio Road** in the Isla Vista area, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/07/10, 6/18/10, 7/02/10 & 7/16/10)

COMMENTS:

- a. **Applicant has changed approach from previous presentations. Specifically, previous presentations had stressed retention of the individual building names and addition of a corporate logo brand. Now the individual building names are proposed to be eliminated and the corporate logo impressed on the buildings as a group with nothing to distinguish the buildings from each other.**

- b. **Approach is unacceptable. SBAR is charged with perpetuating and improving upon the character of IV. The currently proposed approach will eliminate character. As proposed, signs could be anywhere; they are not responsive to or reflective of IV. Need to preserve identity; it is inappropriate to drop a corporate identity onto funky IV.**
- c. **As designed, monument signs have very weak graphics and are too large and ornate.**
- d. **Applicant advised to simplify monument sign; recommend working with a graphic artist to create a strong logo and house it in a simple presentation. A modestly sized internally lit monument sign clad in corten with cut out letters, as discussed during the hearing, would be fine.**
- e. **CBC monument signage would need to be accompanied by individual building signage to perpetuate the names and identities of the individual buildings. Either preserve existing signs or replace them with updated signage in appropriate and individual scripts. The current Balboa script is beautiful and SBAR strongly suggest its reuse. Consider tying the individual building names and scripts together by using one material.**
- f. **Wall signage identifying buildings would be best facing the streetfronts. OK to also have wall signs interior to the parking lot.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary approval.

**3. 10BAR-00000-00062 Essex Property Trust Monument Sign Goleta
10LUP-00000-00012 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Goleta****

Request of Tracy Parker, Woflpack Sigh Group, agent for the owner, Essex Property Trust, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00062 for **further conceptual review of one monument sign of approximately 27.53 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: apartment residences. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 3.0 acre parcel zoned SR-H20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 075-010-009, located at **775 Camino Del Sur** in the Goleta area, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/07/10, 6/18/01, 7/02/10 & 7/16/10)

COMMENTS:

- **Like the sign but it is too tall.**
- **Restudy proportion of sign to base.**
- **Consider turning the sign on its side and eliminating any base.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Appliant to return for further conceptual review.

**4. 10BAR-00000-00063 Essex Property Trust Monument Sign Goleta
10CUP-00000-00013 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Goleta****

Request of Tracey Parker, agent for the owner, Essex Property Trust, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00063 for **further conceptual review of one monument sign (re-hab) of approximately 110 square feet (existing monument) sign face of approximately 19.99 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Housing apartments. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.89 acre parcel zoned SR-H-20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 075-010-026, located at **6711 El Colegio Road** in the Goleta area, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/07/10, 6/18/10,7/02/10 & 7/16/10)

COMMENTS:

- a. **Applicant has changed approach from previous presentations. Specifically, previous presentations had stressed retention of the individual building names and addition of a corporate logo brand. Now the individual building names are proposed to be eliminated and the corporate logo impressed on the buildings as a group with nothing to distinguish the buildings from each other.**

- b. **Approach is unacceptable. SBAR is charged with perpetuating and improving upon the character of IV. The currently proposed approach will eliminate character. As proposed, signs could be anywhere; they are not responsive to or reflective of IV. Need to preserve identity; it is inappropriate to drop a corporate identity onto funky IV.**
- c. **As designed, monument signs have very weak graphics and are too large and ornate.**
- d. **Applicant advised to simplify monument sign; recommend working with a graphic artist to create a strong logo and house it in a simple presentation. A modestly sized internally lit monument sign clad in corten with cut out letters, as discussed during the hearing, would be fine.**
- e. **CBC monument signage would need to be accompanied by individual building signage to perpetuate the names and identities of the individual buildings. Either preserve existing signs or replace them with updated signage in appropriate and individual scripts. The current Balboa script is beautiful and SBAR strongly suggest its reuse. Consider tying the individual building names and scripts together by using one material.**
- f. **Wall signage identifying buildings would be best facing the streetfronts. OK to also have wall signs interior to the parking lot.**
- a. **Return for preliminary review.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.

Mission Canyon/Santa Barbara/Hope Ranch Areas

5. **10BAR-00000-00151 Jesusita Fire Cannell New Residence Mission Canyon**
09JES-00000-00056 (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner) Jurisdiction: Mission

Request of Ketzler and Goodman, architect for the owners, David and Louise Cannell, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00151 for **preliminary/final approval of a new two story residence to replace a residence lost in Jesusita Fire of approximately 3,889 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel due to fire destruction. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.05 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-320-017, located at **2820 Holly Road** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/10)

ACTION: Roberts moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant preliminary/final approval of 10BAR-00000-00151.

6. **10BAR-00000-00158 Bluth Residence Addition and Pool Cabana Santa Barbara**
10LUP-00000-00421 (Brian Banks, Planner) Jurisdiction: Mission Canyon

Request of Akiko Wade Davis, architect for the owner, Carrie Bluth, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00158 for **preliminary approval of a residence addition of approximately 645 square feet and pool cabana of approximately 288 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,565 square feet, attached garage of approximately 316 square feet, shed of approximately 60 square feet and playhouse of approximately 50 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 15 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 22,500 square foot parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-223-005, located at **2825 Glendessary Lane** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/10)

COMMENTS:

Public speaker: Debbie Shaw Booth

BAR Comments:

- **Project received preliminary approval with the comment that the pool was appropriately relocated and the applicant is to be commended on working with the neighbor.**

ACTION: Morris moved, seconded by Roberts and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant preliminary approval of 10BAR-00000-00158. Applicant to return for final on consent at the December 17, 2010 meeting.

7. 09BAR-00000-00105 The Muerte Trust Residence Additions Hope Ranch
09CDH-00000-00024 (Nicole Lieu, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline - Rural**

Request of Kevin Moore, agent for the owners, The Muerte Trust, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00105 for **further conceptual review/preliminary approval of residence addition of approximately 2,119 square feet and an addition over the garage of approximately 460 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 6,000 square feet and garage/guesthouse of approximately 919.5 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 100 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 6.1 acre parcel zoned 2.5-EX-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 063-110-005, located at **4565 Via Huerto** in the Hope Ranch area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/10/09 & 7/16/10)

COMMENTS:

- **Project received preliminary review with the following comments.**
 - **Consider making the fire "pit" ornate and out of iron to further push the theatrical nature of the house.**
 - **Consider thickening post at south east corner of the building to match the thicker posts on the south elevation.**
- **Return for final review on consent.**

ACTION: Goodkind moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Rivera abstains) to grant preliminary approval of 09BAR-000000-00105.

Toro Canyon/Summerland/Carpinteria Areas

8. 09BAR-00000-00067 Brogin New Residence Toro Canyon
09CDP-00000-00024 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Toro**

Request of Nate and Wendy Brogin, owners, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-0067 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 3,500 square feet and garage/storage of approximately 800 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 200 cubic yards of cut and approximately 1,500 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 24,829 square foot parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-320-013, located at **1791 Ocean Oaks Road** in the Carpinteria/Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/22/09)

COMMENTS:

Public speakers: Chris Johnson, Emily Johnson, Don Risdon, Gordon Statler

SBAR Comments:

- Plinth design is problematic.**
- Massing is problematic.**
- Project appears too tall and big for this neighborhood; study a one level scheme.**
- Need a site visit and story poles showing second floor line, first floor line, top plate, heights of terrace retaining walls. Use string lines and flags.**
- Project has lots of retaining walls; need to soften them with plants at rear and in front, bring garden walls in toward the house to allow street front planting.**
- The rural Spanish architectural style nominally chosen distills down to thick walls and simple detailing. Windows at corners won't work; ribbon of tile roof also won't work; detailing needs real attention and simplification.**
- Actual plant list does not reflect description of native plant palette.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review and a site visit.

9. 10BAR-00000-00068 Hixon Garage/Workshop, Gym and Cabana Toro Canyon
10LUP-00000-00311 (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro

Request of Britt Jewett, architect for the owner, Andrew Hixon, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00068 for **preliminary approval of a garage/workshop of approximately 997 square feet, gym of approximately 770 square feet and cabana of approximately 767 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 2,399 square feet, accessory structure of approximately 356 square feet (to be demolished) and carport of approximately 304 square feet (to be demolished). The proposed project will require approximately 127 cubic yards of cut and approximately 125 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 5 acre parcel zoned RR-20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-240-010, located at **900 Toro Canyon Road** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/07/10)

COMMENTS:

- a. **The height modification request affects about 10 square feet of the minor gable end.**
- b. **Comments from previous review still stand; very fun project.**
- c. **Appreciate zone of proposed restoration but don't restrain oaks to just that area. Consider keeping entire plant palette native.**
- d. **Project received preliminary approval, including for the modification to height, with a finding of good design.**
- e. **Return for final review before the full board.**

ACTION: Morris moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Willson absent, Rivera abstained) to grant preliminary approval of 10BAR-0000-00068. Applicant to return for final approval full board.

10. 10BAR-00000-00147 Rothbard Revised Landscape Carpinteria/Toro Canyon
07CDP-00000-00039 (Errin Briggs, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro Canyon

Request of Christopher Price, agent for the owner, Michael Rothbard, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00147 for **further revised final approval of the landscape plan** included with a previously approved single-family residence. A zoning violation (10ZEV-00000-00201) has been established for the property because the existing landscaping is not in conformance with the approved plan including the installation of numerous mature olive trees which impede public views across the property. The previously approved project included demolition of an existing 3,500 square foot residence and the construction of a new residence of approximately 8,800 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 400 square feet and seconded detached garage of approximately 850 square feet, guesthouse of approximately 742 square feet and pool cabana of approximately 800 square feet with a second story gym addition of approximately 504 square feet. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 8,800 square feet, a second residence of approximately 2,500 square feet, a garage/barn of approximately 1,000 square feet and several horse barns. The property is a 22 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-270-006, located at **3215 Foothill Road** in the Toro Canyon/Carpinteria area, First/Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/10 & 11/19/10)

ACTION: Rivera moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Gray absent) to continue 10BAR-00000-00147 to the meeting of December 17, 2010 at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

11. 10BAR-00000-00154 Copus Accessory Structure Summerland
10LUP-00000-00408 (Brian Banks, Planner) Jurisdiction: Summerland

Request of Jennifer Foster, agent for the owner, Dwayne Copus, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00154 for **preliminary/final approval of a new storage structure of approximately 1,296 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 3,760 square feet with attached garage of approximately 800 square feet, barn of approximately 2,592 square feet with attached guest house of approximately 788 square feet, detached garage/storage of approximately 800 square feet and stable of approximately 432 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 2.36 acre parcel

zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-020-030, located at **339 Ortega Ridge** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/10 & 11/19/10)

ACTION: Rivera moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Roberts and Willson absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 10BAR-00000-00154.

**12. 10BAR-00000-00165
CALPROP I, LLC Residential Partial Demolitions/Additions
and Guest House Remodel**

Summerland

(Errin Briggs, Planner)

Jurisdiction: Coastal

Request of Chris Price, agent for the owner, CALPROP I, LLC, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00165 for **conceptual review of demolition/remodel/additions of a residence of approximately 17,160 square feet and demolition/remodel of a guest house approximately 655 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 7,459 square feet with basement of approximately 384 square feet, carport of approximately 860 square feet, guest house of approximately 655 square feet and cabana not including equipment room of approximately 400 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 10 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-260-011, located at **2779 Padaro Lane** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/10)

COMMENTS:

- a. **The SBAR has no concern with the square footage of the house as the visible portion approximately equals the size of the SBAR approved Renker estate (several parcels to the east), the full basement does not add to the height or visual mass of the structure and the applicant indicated they would restrict development of the total 13 acre area that will be the subject of the Lot Line Adjustment to only two parcels rather than the four allowed by zoning.**
- b. **Appreciate horizontality and one story nature of house.**
- c. **Overall, project is very strong and is an appropriate use of the site; SBAR supports having one large estate rather than several estates on the same acreage.**
- d. **Some concern that the formal design of the house is incompatible with the surroundings. There appears to be an absence of hierarchy. Focus on detailing. Restudy proportions of clearstories.**
- e. **Maintenance barn appears quite large next to Padaro; needs to be a very nice structure and will receive scrutiny in that regard upon submittal of an application.**
- f. **SBAR strongly encourages the owner to work with the community as closely as possible to achieve mutual goals of public views to the ocean and homeowner privacy.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary approval.

There being no further business to come before the Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Will Rivera moved, seconded by Lane Goodkind, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Steve Willson absent) that the meeting was adjourned until 9:00 A.M. on Friday, December 17, 2010 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 3:15 P.M.