



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

SOUTH BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of September 7, 2007

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Jeremy Roberts, at 9:28 A.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Jeremy Roberts	Chair
Chris Roberts	Vice Chair
Valerie Froscher	
Pamela Ferguson-Ettinger	
Martha Gray	
Laurie Romano	
David Villalobos	SBAR Secretary
Anne Almy	Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dianne Black, Director, Development Services
Dave Ward, Deputy Director, Development Review South
Michelle Gibbs, Planner, Development Review
Alex Tuttle, Planner, Development Review
Sarah Clark, Planner, Development Review

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 18

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Froscher moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Romano absent) to adopt the following changes to the agenda:

Item No. 2 – St. Athanasius Orthodox Church (04BAR-00000-00147) – Dropped from the Standard Agenda.

Item No. 8 – Jaffe New Residence & Garage (07BAR-00000-00146) – Continued to the meeting of October 5, 2007.

III. MINUTES: Gray moved, seconded by Romano, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Froscher, Ferguson-Ettinger absent) to approve the minutes of August 10, 2007, as revised.

Gray moved, seconded by C. Roberts, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Froscher, Ferguson-Ettinger absent) to approve the minutes of August 24, 2007, as revised.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 07BAR-00000-00160 Skinner Residence Addition Goleta
07SCD-00000-00021 (Holly Bradbury, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta

Request of Carl Schnider, architect for the owner, Robert Skinner, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00160 for **preliminary/final approval on consent of a residence addition of approximately 391 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two-story residence of approximately 3,143 square feet with an attached two-car garage of approximately 400 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.19 acre parcel zoned DR-3.3 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 069-680-006, located at **726 Cathedral Pointe Lane** in the Goleta area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/10/07)

ACTION: Froscher moved, seconded by C. Roberts, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to grant preliminary and final approval on consent of 07BAR-00000-00160.

C-2. 07BAR-00000-00167 Guajardo Residence Addition and New Garage Goleta
07LUP-0000-00440 (Lisa Martin, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta/Coastal

Request of Don Swann, architect for the owners, Ed and Karen Guajardo, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00167 for **preliminary/final approval on consent of a residence addition of approximately 1,002 square feet (net), demolition of the existing 501 square foot garage, and a new attached two car garage of approximately 628 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,971 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 501 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.34 acre parcel zoned 15-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 061-362-026, located at **4615 More Mesa Drive** in the Goleta area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/10/07)

ACTION: Froscher moved, seconded by C. Roberts, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to grant preliminary and final approval on consent of 07BAR-00000-00167.

C-3. 06BAR-00000-00302 Rothbard New Residence Carpinteria
07CDP-00000-00039 (Errin Briggs, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro

Request of Britt Jewett, architect for the owner, Michael Rothbard, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00302 for **final approval on consent of the demolition of an existing 3,500 square foot residence and the construction of a new residence of approximately 8,800 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 400 square feet and seconded detached garage of approximately 850 square feet, guesthouse of approximately 742 square feet and pool cabana of approximately 800 square feet with a second story gym addition of approximately 504 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 3,500 square feet, second residence of approximately 2,500 square feet and a garage/barn of approximately 1,000 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 333 cubic yards of cut and 177 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 22.0 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-270-006, located at **3215 Foothill Road** in the Carpinteria/Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/19/07, 2/23/07, 5/25/07, 6/08/07, 8/10/07, and 8/24/07)

ACTION: Froscher moved, seconded by C. Roberts, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to grant final approval on consent of 06BAR-00000-00302.

CONDITIONS:

- **Remove uplighting at entry gate and substitute with down lights of low wattage.**

- **Eliminate Italian cypress except around house; substitute with olives.**

C-4. 07BAR-00000-00110 Golizadeh Residence Addition and Remodel Goleta
07LUP-00000-00317 (Amy Trester, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta

Request of Hise K, Esparza, agent for the owners, Nelvi and Firouz Golizadeh, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00110 for **final approval on consent of a first floor addition of approximately 366 square feet, porch of approximately 209 square feet and second floor addition of approximately 587 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,221 square feet and garage of approximately 377 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.20 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 065-062-013, located at **84 Lassen Drive** in the Goleta area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 6/8/07, 7/20/07, and 8/24/07)

ACTION: Froscher moved, seconded by C. Roberts, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to grant final approval on consent of 07BAR-00000-00110.

V. SBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: Board members Ferguson-Ettinger and Froscher reiterated their interests in leaving their positions on the SBAR.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None.

VII. STANDARD AGENDA:

1. 06BAR-00000-00316 Santa Barbara Botanic Garden Mission Canyon
06NEW-00000-00138 (Alex Tuttle, Planner) Jurisdiction: DVP

Request of B3 Architects, architect for the owner, Santa Barbara Botanic Garden, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00316 for **further conceptual review of an expansion of facilities that would result in a net increase of approximately 37,631 relative to existing development distributed among 22 new buildings.** Existing development on the site includes 30 buildings totaling approximately 39,130 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 12,393 cubic yards of cut and approximately 8,210 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 78 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-051-004, located at **1212 Mission Canyon Road** in the Mission Canyon area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/23/07)

Project received further conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **The SBAR focused exclusively on improvements proposed at the west of Mission portion of the garden.**
- **The SBAR appreciates the effort that went into the architect's presentation of the project and commends the architect for his capabilities.**
- **The proposed building program as a whole is too big for the site such that finding 6 (*Site layout, orientation, and location of structures and signs will be in an appropriate and well designed relationship to one another, and to the environmental qualities, open spaces and topography of the site*) cannot be made. Proposed buildings are too close together and inappropriately dominate the nose of the ridge on which they are proposed; too much building is proposed south of the existing library. Fire turn around and interior road are too close to Mission Creek. Buildings loom fortress like, corridors seem cavernous. The façade of the library in particular dominates the skyline. Break up the buildings and decrease their sizes, for example, by moving one of the meeting rooms in the multipurpose building to an exterior space.**

- **The project program, which concentrates institutional functions on the West of Mission site, should be studied for dispersal through the other Botanic Garden properties.**
- **With the exception of the children's lab, the proposed scale of buildings is overly massive and the proposed style of buildings institutional in character such that the project is inconsistent with the qualities of the site and the inherent character of the Garden. The children's lab could be integrated more with the landscape e.g., sunken down more. Other structures should, like the children's lab, incorporate living roofs and possibly rammed earth walls.**
- **Structures need to integrate into the site. Green, indoor/outdoor architecture is an imperative direction for this project. It is better to improve the indoor/outdoor relationships of existing development on the site than dominate the area of existing development with buildings as proposed. Buildings must be quiet and should become a national example of LEEDS and green buildings.**
- **Use of rocks and boulders is appropriate. Materials should be natural to build on the character of the place.**
- **The Garden has, since its inception, been a community resource and it should remain a community resource. The original intent of the Garden is important such that neighborhood compatibility will be found only in carrying out that intent. Mission Canyon residential development cannot be the basis for a finding of neighborhood compatibility with the Garden project. The Garden is an icon of the natural environment: buildings must be subordinate to the landscape and indigenous; currently, buildings create an apparent barrier between nature and people. Children's building should be example for the other structures although it's location on the site is questionable. The architecture should be site specific and forward thinking with more single story to allow interatection with outdoors.**
- **It is problematic that the Gane House has been allowed to fall into disrepair as that indicates a lack of respect for the historic character of the Garden. Expansion of the Garden should include restoration of historic structures as well as maintenance of the Garden's historic relationship to the land.**
- **Fencing should be natural and integrate into landscape. Live plants should be an option. Chain link is very inappropriate although there may be some areas where post and wire fencing (like at Sedgwick Ranch) may be appropriate.**
- **Proposed new entry is problematic with use of too much fill and removal of large tree. Restudy.**
- **Project review needs to be broken down into understandable components. Staff is directed to organize.**
- **SBAR will review east of Mission development on October 5, 2007.**

PUBLIC COMMENT – The following people commented on this item:

- Shems Mondell
- Paulina Conn (plus letter)
- Milt Roselinsky (Mission Canyon Association/Friends of Mission Canyon)
- Christina McGinnis
- Nancy Johnson (Santa Barbara Botanic Garden)

Isla Vista/Goleta

2. **04BAR-00000-00147 St. Athanasius Orthodox Church Goleta**
01CUP-00000-00152 (Alex Tuttle, Planner) Ridgeline: Hollister

Request of Jonathan Leech, Dudek and Associates, agent for the owner, St. Athanasius, to consider Case No. 04BAR-00000-00147 for **preliminary approval of a 4.6 acre church complex consisting of four structures totaling approximately 26,500 square feet; a one story temple of approximately 8,455 square feet, a one story chapel of approximately 750 square**

feet, a one story fellowship hall of 14,560 square feet and a one story administration building of approximately 2,735 square feet. No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project is on a level parcel and will require grading. The property is a 21.75 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 071-140-072, located at **5441 Hollister Avenue** in the Goleta area, Second District. (Continued from 8/13/04, 3/11/05, and 7/20/07)

ACTION: C. Roberts moved, seconded by Froscher, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to drop 04BAR-00000-00147 from the Standard Agenda. See Agenda Status Report.

3. 07BAR-00000-00200 Skidmore Single Family Dwelling Goleta
07ZCI-00000-00043 (Sarah Clark, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta

Request of Bob Easton, architect for the owners, Dottie and Jack Skidmore, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00200 for **conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 4,544 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 451 square feet.** The lot is currently vacant. The proposed project will require approximately 267 cubic yards of cut and approximately 427 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned I-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 059-440-026, located at **1230 San Antonio Creek Road** in the Goleta area, Second Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant may return for further conceptual review/preliminary. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **Stylistically sound.**
- **Site slopes and architectural solution creating a flat pad causes a tight area of 2:1 slope on east side of house. Restudy to achieve a more organic solution.**
 - **Consider stepping house down to eliminate fill.**
 - **Consider stepping down from house to turf area.**
 - **Consider cobble battered wall to eliminate "plinth".**
- **Address entry area.**
 - **Restudy guest parking.**
 - **Consider eliminating gates and wing walls (inconsistent with character of area).**
- **Architect should become informed about the project planned for lot adjacent and to the east to ensure thoughtful integration with this project.**

4. 07BAR-00000-00205 Gin Single Family Dwelling Addition Goleta
07LUP-00000-00545 (Lisa Martin, Planner) Jurisdiction: Goleta

Request of Mark Mansfeld, architect for the owners, Irene and Ron Gin, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00205 for **conceptual review of a second floor addition of approximately 485 square feet to the existing residence and legalization of an unpermitted garage conversion to habitable space.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,450 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.14 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 065-164-009, located at **684 Andy Lane** in the Goleta area, Second Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **Proposed addition is inconsistent with *Eastern Goleta Design Guidelines*; architect referred to Guidelines for redesign.**

- **Redesign of addition should take into consideration the entirety of the home.**
- **SBAR encourages addition of streetscape plantings.**

5. **07BAR-00000-00203** **St. George Duplex** **Isla Vista**
07CDH-00000-00023 (Jim Heaton, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ocean

Request of Eric Swensumson, agent for the owner, Ed St. George, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00203 for **conceptual review of a new two-story duplex of approximately 3,195 square feet.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: a residence of approximately 714 square feet (to be demolished). The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.2 acre parcel zoned SR-M-18 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 075-212-016, located at **6560 Del Playa Drive** in the Isla Vista area, Third Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **Restudy and reorganize site plan.**
 - **The conformation of the proposed duplex forces the easement for the driveway to the proposed rear yard parking unsuccessfully and tightly up against the adjacent duplex and carport.**
 - **Provide green space between the proposed new duplex and the adjacent duplex.**
 - **Provide access to the carport entirely within the project site.**
- **Proposed square architectural design is too broad and flat: redesign.**
- **Project provides an opportunity to improve aesthetics of the neighborhood consistent with the goals of the Isla Vista Redevelopment Area. Architect is encouraged to be more playful and creative in the design solution.**

Mission Canyon/Santa Barbara/Hope Ranch Areas

6. **03BAR-00000-00316** **Franklin Patio Covers** **Mission Canyon**
Roof Change/Color Change
07LUP-00000-00582 (Amy Trester, Planner) Ridgeline: Urban

Request of Joseph H. Moticha, architect for the owner, Jack Franklin, to consider Case No. 03BAR-00000-00316 for **revised final approval of new patio covers of 200 square feet, changing a portion of the roof from a gable to shed roof, an exterior color change, deleting two windows and adding one new window and changing the shape of a permitted bay window.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 4,239 square feet, a garage and bath of approximately 678 square feet and decks of 848 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.23 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1-D and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-141-016, located at 2895 Kenmore Place in the Mission Canyon area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 12/05/03, 2/27/04, 3/26/04, 4/30/04, 6/4/04, 7/16/04, and 8/27/04)

Item was continued to a future date. No motion was made. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **SBAR members will do individual site visits out of deference for neighbors concerned about the loss of their private views.**
- **Applicant to return with proposed colors.**
- **Bay window is acceptable.**

PUBLIC COMMENT – The following people commented on this item:

- Naftaly Glasman (plus letter)
- Mike Anzlowar

7. **07BAR-00000-00213** Robinette-Feen Single Mission Canyon
Family Dwelling Additions
(no planner assigned) Jurisdiction: Mission

Request of Ken Dickson, agent for the owners, Christina Robinette and Dina Feen, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00213 for **conceptual review of a living room addition of approximately 35 square feet and master bedroom + bath addition of approximately 360 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 835 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 240 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.14 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-171-016, located at **804 Windsor Way** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant may return for preliminary/final. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **Applicant to apply for LUP prior to further SBAR review.**
- **Applicant to submit to review by Mission Canyon Design Review Board prior to returning to SBAR.**
- **Return with accurately drawn plans illustrating proposed exterior finish materials.**
- **Some concern about narrowness of proposed new entryway; consider removing brick planter.**

Toro Canyon/Summerland/Carpinteria Areas

8. **07BAR-00000-00146** Jaffe New Residence and Garage Summerland
07CDP-00000-00089 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) 07MOD-00000-00007 Jurisdiction: Ridgeline – Rural

Request of Brad Williams and Marmol Radzineer, architect and agent for the owner, Michael Jaffe, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00146 for **further conceptual review of a new 3,713 square foot single-family dwelling with a 914 square foot basement and a 494 square foot attached 2-car garage, 2,302 square foot of decks, a 472 square foot pool and 102 square foot spa. Also, the new SFD will have an average plate height of 9'-6" throughout the entire house, and within the Summerland Community Plan area a penalty for plate heights over 9'-0" increase the overall Floor Area (FAR) of the home to 7,195 square feet (2,517 square feet over the maximum FAR allowed).** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 360 cubic yards of cut and approximately 2,350 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned AG-1-20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-080-011, located at **380 Ortega Ridge Road** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 6/22/07)

ACTION: **C. Roberts moved, seconded by Froscher, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to continue 07BAR-00000-00146 to the SBAR meeting of October 5, 2007. See Agenda Status Report.**

9. 06BAR-00000-00176 Nguyen New Residence Summerland
06CDP-00000-00078 (Holly Bradbury, Planner) Jurisdiction: Summerland

Request of Richele Mailand, agent for the owner, David Nguyen, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00176 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,200 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 154 cubic yards of cut and approximately 415 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 7,506 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-152-062, located at **180 Valencia Road** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 9/15/06, 11/03/06, 1/05/07, 2/23/07, 3/16/07, 4/27/07, and 5/11/07)

Item not heard due to lack of a quorum.

10. 07BAR-00000-00212 Hall New Single Family Dwelling Toro Canyon
07CDP-00000-00093 (Sarah Clark, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro

Request of Lu Ann Hall, owner, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00212 for **conceptual review of new modular home of approximately 2,679 square feet, demolition of portion of the existing residence and conversion of the remainder to a guesthouse of approximately 800 square feet with attached storage of approximately 650 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 2,270 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 360 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 34 cubic yards of cut and approximately 34 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.85 acre parcel zoned A-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-140-077, located at **450 Toro Canyon Road** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **Graphic information is inadequate to describe project; return with plans drawn to scale; show materials and colors.**
- **Height of structure exceeds the 16 foot height limit.**
- **Existing home is charming; consider remodel rather than demolition and conversion to a guesthouse.**
- **SBAR will do drive by visits to determine visibility of the site.**

11. 05BAR-00000-00185 Sutherland Residence Addition and Remodel Toro Canyon
05CDP-00000-00074 (Previously 04CDP-00000-00140) (Holly Bradbury, Planner) Ridgeline: Rural

Request of Susan Sherwin, agent for the owner, Toni Sutherland, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00185 (previously 04BAR-00000-00311) for **preliminary/final approval of a guesthouse of approximately 795 square feet, understory storage room (under guesthouse) of approximately 247 square feet and new deck area of approximately 1,096 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 2,028 square feet and garage of approximately 615 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of grading. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-140-058, located at **428 Toro Canyon Road** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/14/05, 2/25/05, 4/8/05, 4/15/05, 10/14/05, and 2/23/07)

ACTION: C. Roberts moved, seconded by Romano, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Froscher, Ferguson-Ettinger absent) to grant preliminary approval of 05BAR-00000-00185. Applicant may return for final on consent.

SBAR COMMENTS:

- **SBAR confirmed that height is acceptable.**
- **New project should inform future redevelopment of home when it occurs.**
- **Return for final on consent with color/materials board. Selected color needs to bind the complex together as a whole complementing the existing vegetation as well as the home. Consider painting walls or one wall on the existing home to remain. Strive to simplify color palette overall. Darker is better.**

There being no further business to come before the Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Gray moved, seconded by Romano, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Froscher, Ferguson-Ettinger absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 9:00 A.M. on Friday, September 21, 2007 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 3:57 P.M.