



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

**SOUTH
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of May 22, 2009**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Will Rivera, at 9:12 A.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Will Rivera	Chair
Laurie Romano	Vice Chair
Martha Gray	
Chris Roberts	
Jeremy Roberts	
Glen Morris	
Steve Willson	
David Villalobos	Board Assistant Supervising
Anne Almy	Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 15±

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

- I. PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.
- II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT:** Romano moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Gray, Morris and J. Roberts absent) to:
 - Continue Item # 7 08BAR-00000-00078 Toor Residence Additions and Second Story to the meeting of June 5, 2009.
- III. MINUTES:** Romano moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a 4 to 0 to 3 (Gray, Morris and J. Roberts abstained) to approve the Minutes of May 8, 2009 as revised.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 09BAR-00000-00068 Oberfield New Residence Toro Canyon
06LUP-00000-00559 (Eric Gage, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Toro**

Request of Derrick Eichelberger, architect for the owners, Mauricio Oberfield, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00068 (Previously 06BAR-00000-00148) for **revised final approval on consent of a new residence of approximately 9,739 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require 900 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 5.012 acre parcel zoned 10-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-250-011, located at **810 Cima Del Mundo** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/21/06, 9/22/06, 11/03/06, 1/05/07 & 1/19/07)

ACTION: Romano moved, seconded by J. Roberts and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to continue 09BAR-00000-00068 to the meeting of June 5, 2009 for further final approval on consent.

C-2. 08BAR-00000-00236 Knee Demolition / New Residence and Garage Carpinteria
08CDH-00000-00041 (J. Ritterbeck Planner) **Jurisdiction: Coastal**

Request of Loren Solin, architect for the owners, Mr. and Mrs. Kevin Knee, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00236 for **final approval on consent of a new residence of approximately 2,483 square feet and detached garage of approximately 440 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 978 square feet and detached garage of approximately 421 square feet (to be demolished.) The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 19,550 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 003-421-002, located at **4405 Avenue Del Mar** in the Carpinteria area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/14/08 & 4/24/09 & 5/08/09)

ACTION: Romano moved, seconded by J. Roberts and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant final approval on consent of 08BAR-00000-00236.

V. SBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: SBAR would like a briefing on the Jesusita Fire response. As representatives of the County, the SBAR needs to be aware of how the County is approaching the rebuilding of the devastated area.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None.

VII. STANDARD AGENDA:

Isla Vista/Goleta

1. 08BAR-00000-00235 Sciutto Patio Enclosure Santa Barbara
08LUP-00000-00602 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Goleta**

Request of Michael Lancy, architect for the owners, Charles and Joy Sciutto, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00235 for **further conceptual review of a patio enclosure of approximately 674 square feet.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: a residence of 2,599 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 7,469 square foot parcel zoned 10-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 069-314-008, located at **5461 Toltec Drive** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/14/08)

COMMENTS:

a. Project is being presented as an existing situation but because this was an illegal addition, SBAR needs to be able to distinguish what was there originally vs. what is

- d. **Replace windows at former garage and relate new windows with fenestration on second story above.**
- e. **Strongly encourage narrowing skirt and reorganizing curb cut to allow for a straight shot up the east side of the lot to the rear parking area. Add landscaping at narrowed skirt.**
- f. **Consider design elements that would emphasize the front door.**
- g. **Return for further conceptual/preliminary review with landscaping.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual/preliminary approval.

**4. 09BAR-00000-00071 Querfurth Residence Addition Santa Barbara
09LUP-00000-00160 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Goleta****

Request of Salvador Melendez, architect for the owner, Majorie E. Querfurth, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00071 for **further conceptual review of a residence addition of approximately 1,785 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,583 square feet, and detached garage of approximately 350 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.85 acre parcel zoned 8-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 057-113-007, located at **691 Hope Avenue** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/8/09)

COMMENTS:

- a. **The existing home is charming and the challenge in this project is to perpetuate that charm. Scale of house with proposed additions is so different than the original that design currently fails in retaining original charm.**
- b. **Consistency between elevations is very important.**
- c. **Arches on west elevation are too tight in relationship to roof.**
- d. **Picket fencing at east elevation is busy and distracting; restudy; consider a planter instead and consider offsetting patio area away from exterior house wall.**
- e. **South elevation needs more articulation as it faces neighboring residential development and needs to express the character of the house. North elevation also needs more development.**
- f. **Restudy scale of columns at north and east elevations.**
- g. **Restudy trellis.**
- h. **Reorganize venting of the house to achieve the cross ventilation desired.**
- i. **Graphically distinguish between what is existing and what is proposed.**
- j. **Return for further conceptual review.**

Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.

**5. Discussion Item County Emergency Operations Center Santa Barbara
Jurisdiction: Goleta**

Request of Celeste Manolas, for the County of Santa Barbara General Services Capital Projects, to discuss **County of Santa Barbara Emergency Operations Center of approximately 10,000 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 7,000 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 37.49 acre parcel zoned REC and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 059-120-003, located at **4400 Cathedral Oaks Road** in the Santa Barbara area, Second/ Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

- a. **SBAR appreciates the opportunity to review the proposed project but also believes that earlier consultation with SBAR on a conceptual level would have resulted in a better project.**
- b. **Character of the building is disappointing; it is developed to a utilitarian program rather than being architecturally inspiring.**
- c. **As proposed, building could be any municipal building anywhere in the States; building has no sense of place.**
- d. **Project is a missed opportunity to inspire. While designing toward a high leed standard is commendable, design should have also been architecturally interesting**

- and cutting edge to represent the far sightedness of the county. Project should have been a representation of what is possible on a rebuild that would be fire safe.
- e. Need to show existing plant materials to be removed and to remain.
 - f. Proposed landscape design should demonstrate definitive fire protection zones and be a model for fire safe planting.
 - g. Landscaping should blend into the surroundings and not become a green blotch in a browned coastal California setting.
 - h. Need to develop a landscape maintenance plan and a fuel modification program as part of the project design.

Project was a discussion item only, no action was taken.

6. **09BAR-00000-00075 Kelley/Lautstsen As-Built Accessory Structure Santa Barbara**
09LUP-00000-00061 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline**
Request of Steven M. Fort, agent and Justin Van Mullen, architect for the owners, Stafford T. Kelley and Elaine M. Lautstsen, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00075 for **preliminary/final approval of an as-built accessory structure of approximately 490 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 781 square feet with a carport of approximately 238 square feet and second residence of approximately 3,750 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 2.96 acre parcel zoned 40-AL and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 153-340-010, located at **street addresses 1806 and 1812 San Marcos Pass** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/08/09)

COMMENTS:

- a. **The building is associated with a large terraced grass area which appears as a green blotch in a natural setting open to public views from Hwy. 154.**
- b. **Less concern about the building than about the setting which was manipulated – terraced and planted in green lawn – to allow for construction of the building.**
- c. **Re: building**
 - o **Patina handrails.**
 - o **No need for planter on rooftop if rails remain.**
- d. **Re: landscape setting, need to camouflage building from public view by redesigning landscape setting.**
 - o **Reduce or eliminate lawn (would achieve water savings as well as design improvement)**
 - o **Add in native grasses and scrub plant materials.**
 - o **Linear arrangement of screening oaks is out of context. Cluster additional oaks in area to eliminate rigidity of planting design.**
- e. **Return for further review with landscape plan.**

ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Romano absent) to continue 09BAR-00000-00075 for further preliminary/final approval.

Mission Canyon/Santa Barbara/Hope Ranch Areas

7. **08BAR-00000-00078 Toor Residence Additions and Second Story Santa Barbara**
08LUP-00000-00170 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Goleta**
Request of Chris Thomas, agent for the owner, Iqbal Toor, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00078 for **preliminary/final approval of a residence first floor addition of approximately 142 square feet, second story addition of approximately 1,406 square feet, second story deck of approximately 172 square feet and covered porch of approximately 122 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,400 square feet, attached garage of approximately 441 square feet and porch of approximately 136 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 8,760 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 065-223-013, located at **4773 Avalon Avenue** in the Santa Barbara area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 6/06/08 & 7/11/08 & 9/19/08)

ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Rivera absent) to continue 08BAR-00000-00078 to the meeting of June 5, 2009 at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

8. 09BAR-00000-00026 Messerlian Residence Addition Mission Canyon
09LUP-00000-00127 (Lisa Martin, Planner) Jurisdiction: Mission

Request of Akiko Wade Davis, agent for the owners, George and Sally Messerlian, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00026 for **preliminary/final approval of a residence addition of approximately 175 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 2,410 square feet and attached garage of approximately 377 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 12,000 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-164-010, located at **861 Cheltenham** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 3/13/09)

ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by Willson and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Romano and Morris absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 09BAR-00000-00026.

9. 09BAR-00000-00086 McBirney Residence Addition Mission Canyon
(Kimberley McCarthy Planner) Jurisdiction: Mission

Request of Mike McBirney, owner, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00086 for **conceptual review of a residence addition of approximately 625 square feet, demolition of an existing covered deck of approximately 252 square feet, new deck of approximately 550 square feet, with 116 square feet of new deck to be covered, the validation of an existing carport and demolition of approximately 168 square feet of existing carport.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 982 square feet, garage of approximately 239 square feet, carport of approximately 484 square feet and covered porch of approximately 78 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 17,860 square foot parcel zoned 10-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-223-009, located at **751 Mission Park Drive** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

- a. Nice project. Proposed additions maintain language and character of the existing house. Good location for an addition.
- b. Consider adding trellises.
- c. Consider building up grade at porch to eliminate need for railing.
- d. SBAR does not agree with Mission Canyon ARC suggestion of adding skylights.
- e. Return for preliminary/final reviews before the full board.

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary/final approval.

Toro Canyon/Summerland/Carpinteria Areas

10. 08BAR-00000-00244 Meister Family Trust New Two Car Garage and Workshop Toro Canyon
08CDP-00000-00174 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro

Request of Nancy Ferguson, agent for the owners, Craig and Sharon Meister Family Trust, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00244 for **preliminary/final approval of a two car garage and workshop of approximately 804 square feet. (Residential Second Unit of approximately 1,325 square feet is also proposed but not in for SBAR review.)** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,552 square feet and attached two-car-garage. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 26,700 square foot parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-370-003, located at **3165 Serena Avenue** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 12/05/08)

ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by Gray and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Romano and Morris absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 08BAR-00000-00244.

- 11. 09BAR-00000-00076 Nicks Driveway Material Change Carpinteria/Toro Canyon**
06CDH-00002-00004 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ocean Lot
Request of Patsy Stadelman, agent for the owner, Stephanie and George Dewey Nicks, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00076 for **revised final approval (previous BAR number 05BAR-00000-00248) of the approved landscape plan to previously approved residence of approximately 2,925 square feet.** The property is an 11,366 square foot parcel zoned 8-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-390-007 located at **3292 Beach Club Road** in the Carpinteria area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/15/08 & 5/08/09)
ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Morris absent) to grant final approval of 09BAR-00000-00076.
- 12. 09BAR-00000-00067 Brogin New Residence Toro Canyon**
09CDP-00000-00024 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro
Request of Nate and Wendy Brogin, owners, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00067 for **conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 3,500 square feet and garage/storage of approximately 800 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 200 cubic yards of cut and approximately 1,500 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 24,829 square foot parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-320-013, located at **1791 Ocean Oaks Road** in the Carpinteria/Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.
COMMENTS:
Public speakers: William Lord, Robert Logue, Don Risdien, Emily Johnson, Tim Doles.
SBAR Comments:
a. Drawings are incomplete and inaccurate such that the SBAR is unable to comment on the project.
b. Drawings need to reflect topography and how the house sits on the site. Show both existing and proposed grades.
c. Elevational drawings never show perspective: revise to accurately depict what is proposed.
d. SBAR strongly recommends that applicant hire an architect who can accurately draw what is desired and can present the project to the SBAR.
e. Applicant is advised to work with neighbors.
Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.
- 13. 08BAR-00000-00011 Carpinteria Valley Farms Agricultural Building Summerland**
08DVP-00000-00009/ (Sarah Clark, Planner) Jurisdiction: Summerland
08CDP-00000-00027/08CUP-0000-00016
Request of Brent Daniels, agent for the owner, Carpinteria Valley Farms, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00011 for **further conceptual review/preliminary/final approval of an agricultural building approximately 4,140 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 18,910 square feet, attached garage of approximately 750 square feet, guest house of approximately 800 square feet, pool house of approximately 800 square feet, accessory structure of approximately 1,000 square feet and a foot horse stable (including two agricultural employee dwellings) of approximately 13,487 square feet.. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 19.73 acre parcel zoned AG-I-20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-210-056, located at **2800 Via Real** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/29/08)
COMMENTS:
Public speaker: Tom Evans.
SBAR Comments:
a. SBAR was not and is not in favor of the location, size, bulk and scale of the building and it will be very visible as approved by the PC. It is unclear how the SBAR input on

the project weighed in the PC decision. If the PC wants the SBAR to deliberate on “appropriate screening”, the PC needs to define what that is. There is no way to appropriately screen this building as designed in its approved location as there is not enough room on the short steep slope to create foreground, mid or background plantings and any such planting will further obscure public views to the mountains.

- b. Eliminate widow’s walk.
- c. Show native understory on landscape plan.
- d. Create additional planting areas on north, south and east corners of building.
- e. Locate Eucalyptus and oaks in an informal arrangement on slope allowing views to the mountains.
- f. Project received preliminary approval with modifications to landscape plan as drawn on plans.

ACTION: J. Roberts moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Morris absent) to grant preliminary approval of 08BAR-00000-00011.

14. 09BAR-00000-00066 St. George Residence Addition, Garage Demolition/Rebuild, Carport, 2nd Story Unit Isla Vista
09CDH-00000-00012 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Isla Vista**

Request of Eric Swenumson, agent for the owner, Ed St. George, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00066 for **conceptual review of residence addition of approximately 132 square feet, demolition of existing garage of approximately 400 square feet, proposed garage of approximately 509 square feet, proposed carport of approximately 220 square feet, proposed second story unit of approximately 490 square feet and second story balcony of approximately 210 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 860 square feet and garage of approximately 400 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 10 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 5,000 square foot parcel zoned 10-R-1 and shown as Assessor’s Parcel Number 075-191-016, located at **6721 Sabado Tarde** in the Isla Vista area, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/08/09)

COMMENTS:

- a. Consider limiting paving by using driveway strips where possible. Use permeable paving where paving is needed.
- b. North elevation has a lot of roof; encourage changing pitch to lower height of roof.
- c. Study possible entryway element.
- d. Trapezoidal windows are dated: eliminate from design. Overall, the design is a bit too 70’s to be successful. Push the funk.
- e. Design concept is sculptural in nature with big building forms adjoining each other. For house to be successful, the forms need to work together; materials and color application are very important.
- f. Consider incorporating different materials and colors into the design to underscore basic design concept.
- g. Deck and carport break down the design; restudy.
- h. Add a front porch or patio with fence at front yard to create a useable street side space for the future occupants.
- i. Consider making a study model to refine forms.
- j. Eliminate eaves.
- k. Return for further conceptual review.

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.

There being no further business to come before the Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Jeremy Roberts moved, seconded by Steve Willson, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Will Rivera and Glen Morris absent) that the meeting was adjourned until 9:00 A.M. on Friday, June 5, 2009 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 3:20 P.M.