



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

**SOUTH
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of March 19, 2010**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Will Rivera, at 9:00 A.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Will Rivera	Chair	
Jeremy Roberts	Vice Chair	
Martha Gray		
Jeff Yardy		
Lane Goodkind		
Anita Hodosy-McFaul		SBAR Secretary
Anne Almy	Supervising Planner	

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: Glen Morris and Steve Willson

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 15±

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Roberts moved, seconded by Gray and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to:

- **Drop Item 1 08BAR-00000-00279 St. George New 3 story Multi-Family Apartment Buildings from the agenda at the request of the Applicant.**
- **Drop Item 10 09BAR-00000-00186 Summerland Market Exterior Alterations from the agenda at the request of the applicants.**

III. MINUTES: Gray moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to approve the Minutes of March 5, 2010 as revised.

IV. SBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: None.

V. STAFF UPDATE: Hope Ranch Brown Bag Lunch meeting is scheduled for April 16, 2010.
The public is welcome to participate. The meeting will be in the Planning Commission Hearing room and is scheduled between 12:00 p.m. and 1:30 p.m.

VI. STANDARD AGENDA:

Isla Vista/Goleta

1. **08BAR-00000-00279**

St. George New Three-Story Multi-Family Apartment Buildings **Isla Vista**
08DVP-00000-00040 (Alex Tuttle, Planner) **Jurisdiction: DVP**

Request of Shubin and Donaldson Architects, architect for the owner, Edward St. George, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00279 for **final approval of 56 new one-, two-, and three bedroom units comprising five buildings surrounding a central courtyard, totaling approximately 52,500 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: three one-story day care buildings of approximately 2,560 square feet, 850 square feet and 815 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 665 cubic yards of cut and approximately 1,300 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2 acre parcel zoned SR-H-20 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 075-101-022, located at **870 Camino del Sur** in the Isla Vista area, Third Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/16/09, 1/30/09, 2/13/09, 3/27/09, 6/5/09, 2/05/10, 2/19/10 & 3/5/10)

ACTION: Roberts moved, seconded by Gray and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to drop 08BAR-00000-00279 from the agenda at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

2. **10BAR-00000-00042**

Erickson New Residence, Guest House & Agricultural Accessory Structure **Goleta**
(No Assigned Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline - Rural**

Request of James Bell, architect for the owner, Shawn Erickson, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00042 for **conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,996 square feet, guest house of approximately 783 square feet and agricultural accessory structure of approximately 272 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 310 cubic yards of cut and approximately 140 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 6.16 acre parcel zoned AG-II-40 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 077-080-021, located at **0 Glen Annie Road** in the Goleta area, Third Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

Public speaker: Caroline Casale.

SBAR Comments:

- **Planner to confirm appropriateness, from an historic building perspective, of adding a lower story to the building.**
- **Return for preliminary/final following planning review and clearance with landscape plan addressing erosion or disturbed slopes and locations of trees.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary/final approval at the April 2, 2010 meeting.

Mission Canyon/Santa Barbara/Hope Ranch Areas

3. **09BAR-00000-00201** **Henderson Residence Addition** **Mission Canyon**
09LUP-00000-00542 (Lisa Martin, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline-Urban**

Request of Kirk Gradin, architect for the owner, Dan Henderson, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00201 for **further conceptual/preliminary/final approval of residence addition/remodel of approximately 595 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,935 square feet and garage of approximately 443 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 20 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 6,540 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-171-010, located at **2725 Exeter Place** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/08/10)

COMMENTS:

- Nice project.
- Project received final approval with modifications made during the hearing.

ACTION: Roberts moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 09BAR-00000-00201.

4. 10BAR-00000-00015 Convis Residence Addition Mission Canyon

10LUP-00000-00032 (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Mission**

Request of Andy Ribbins, agent for the owner, Gary Convis, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00015 for **final approval of residence addition of approximately 615 square feet**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,620 square feet and garage of approximately 470 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 12 cubic yards of cut and approximately 8 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 7,630 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-150-011, located at **986 Cheltenham** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/19/10 & 03/05/10)

CONDITION:

- Project received final approval with the condition that the lamp on the exterior light fixture shall be shielded or the glass in the fixture shall be opalescent.

ACTION: Yardy moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to grant final approval of 10BAR-00000-00015.

5. 09BAR-00000-00196 Gruel As-Built Garage Conversion/Addition Mission Canyon

09LUP-00000-00507 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Mission**

Request of Syndi Souter, agent, Tony Xiques, architect, for the owner, Julie Gruel, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00196 for **preliminary/final approval of an as-built garage conversion of approximately 786 square feet with a residential addition of approximately 60 square feet**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,486 square feet and four storage sheds of approximately 120 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 15,246 square foot parcel zoned 12-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 067-050-016, located at **5130 Cathedral Oaks Road** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/08/10)

ACTION: Gray moved, seconded by Goodkind and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 09BAR-00000-00196.

6. 10BAR-00000-00039 Tabasgo Living Trust New Residence, Garage and Observatory Santa Barbara

(No Assigned Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline-Rural**

Request of Taalman Koch, architect and Bildsten and Sherwin Design Studio, agent for the owners, Tabasgo Living Trust, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00039 for **conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,610 square feet, garage of approximately 750 square feet and observatory of approximately 294 square feet**. The following structure currently exists on the parcel: a residence (to be removed) of approximately 2,340 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 32.05 acre parcel zoned 40-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 021-020-010, located at **1297 West Mountain Drive** in the Santa Barbara area, First Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

- Drawings are not adequately descriptive of the proposal; return with photographs of existing built kit houses with the same detailing as that proposed.**
- Disappointed that the previous proposal is not moving forward as that project was very contextual but understand how construction costs can make a project infeasible.**

- c. **This project has lost the beauty in architectural design of the previous proposal and looks like it could be located anywhere. Garage is a total departure from the cubic modular residence. Design of the observatory is banal. There is currently no consistency between buildings. The site is stunning; currently the house is not responding to the site and the structures are not speaking to each other. Restudy proposal.**
- d. **Need to see evidence that the project will be executed in a manner representative of the site. Project needs to work with the site architecturally and programmatically.**
- e. **Consider using on site materials such as rammed earth instead of the concrete walls as proposed. Allow the project to grow out of the site.**
- f. **Lots of glazing may lead to adverse night lighting impacts. Proposed anodized aluminum cladding of observatory will make it glow in the sun all day and is an inappropriate material; redesign.**
- g. **Return with landscape plan.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.

7. **09BAR-00000-00178 Melton Addition/New Garage Hope Ranch**
09LUP-00000-00474 (Kimberly McCarthy, Planner) Jurisdiction: Design Overlay

Request of Eric Swenumson, agent for the owners, Kurt Melton and Judy Mouderrres, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00178 for **further conceptual review and preliminary approval of an addition of approximately 903 square feet to the existing residence and a new attached garage of approximately 558 square feet.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,412 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 20 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 0.46 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 061-191-005, located at **295 Arboleda Road** in the Hope Ranch area, Second Supervisorial District. (Continued from 12/04/09)

COMMENTS:

Public speaker: James Kennedy

SBAR Comments:

- a. **Charm of the existing small ranch house with simple details is getting lost in the proposed remodel. Small simple ranch houses do not have towers and they are not clad in stone. Styles are competing to the detriment of the project. If a tower were to be included in the project design, the entire house would need to be redesigned to create the appropriate context. Better to work with style of the existing house.**
- b. **Continued concern with entry tower: not contextual, proportionately does not read as a tower, and does not function well as an entry on the exterior. Garage is sticking so far out that it competes with the tower for the entry statement and the tower is too tucked into the house to function as an entry on the inside as well. Consider eliminating tower in favor of a porch which extends out further to the street. Consider pushing garage back into the site.**
- c. **Reconsider use of stone veneer; may be appropriate as a base material (such as a wainscot) or for use as pavers in the landscape design.**
- d. **Arched windows at street are not contextual: eliminate.**
- e. **Return with landscape plan; would benefit review of the house.**

Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual/preliminary approval.

**8. 10BAR-00000-00040 Kelly/Ellersieck Residence Remodel and Addition Hope Ranch
10LUP-00000-00052 (Brian Banks, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Ridgeline- Urban****

Request of Craig Shallenberger, agent for the owners, Wendy Lynn Kelly and Betty Jo Ellersieck to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00040 for **conceptual review of a residence first floor addition of approximately 1,767 square feet and patio of approximately 54 square feet with a second floor addition of approximately 171 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 2,868 square feet, detached garage of approximately 1,000 square feet, a shed and a pool. The proposed project will require approximately 300 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1.47 acre parcel zoned 1.5-EX-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 061-301-005, located at **4255 Vieja Drive** in the Hope Ranch area Second Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

- a. **Good job considering the program and the existing structure. Seems contextual with existing house and garage.**
- b. **Restudy entry; currently small and disproportionate given its location. Entry can get larger (taller and wider). Add some of the woodwork details that appear elsewhere on the house.**
- c. **Return for preliminary review with indication of the proposed limit of work, the ESH boundary, and an appropriate plant list and landscape plan.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary approval.

Toro Canyon/Summerland/Carpinteria Areas

**9. 10BAR-00000-00033 Allen Residence Remodel and Addition Summerland
(No Assigned Planner) **Jurisdiction: Summerland****

Request of Mark Shields and Lloyd Malar, architects for the owner, Brad Allen, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00033 for **conceptual review of a residence addition of approximately 36 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence and attached garage of approximately 3,900 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 17,342 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-240-035, located at **2425 East Finney Street** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District.

COMMENTS:

- **Nice solution.**
- **Clean.**
- **Great improvement.**

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary approval.

**10. 09BAR-00000-00186 Summerland Market Exterior Alterations Summerland
07BDP-00000-00689 (Kimberly McCarthy, Planner) **Jurisdiction: Summerland****

Request of Jim Feinberg, agent for the owner, Rose Robinson Trust, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00186 for **preliminary/final approval of exterior alterations, including faux chimney and change to approved lighting fixtures above gas pumps.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: market and gas pumps of approximately 2,500 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.28 acre parcel zoned C-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-177-005, located at **2285 Lillie Avenue** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 01/08/10 & 03/05/10)

ACTION: Roberts moved, seconded by Gray and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Morris and Willson absent) to drop 09BAR-00000-00186 from the agenda at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

There being no further business to come before the Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Will Rivera moved, seconded by Lane Goodkind, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Glen Morris, Steve Willson and Jeremy Roberts absent) that the meeting was adjourned until 9:00 A.M. on Friday, April 2, 2010 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.
Meeting adjourned at 12:40 P.M.