



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of February 23, 2007

Jeremy Roberts Chair
Chris Roberts Vice Chair
Robin Donaldson
Valerie Froscher
Pamela Ferguson-Ettinger
Martha Gray
Anita Hodosy BAR Secretary
Anne Almy - Planner III

REVISED MEETING LOCATION
Santa Barbara County
Fourth Floor Board of Supervisors Hearing Room
105 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, California 93101
(805) 568-2000

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Jeremy Roberts, at 9:00 A.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Jeremy Roberts Chair
Chris Roberts Vice Chair
Robin Donaldson
Valerie Froscher
Pamela Ferguson-Ettinger
Martha Gray
Anita Hodosy BAR Secretary
Michelle Gibbs Planner III

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: The full board was present.

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 15±

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None.

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Gray moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Donaldson and Froscher absent) to:

- Drop Item # 7 05BAR-00000-00185 Sutherland Residence Addition and Remodel from the agenda at the request of the applicant.
- Continue Item 8 06BAR-00000-00176 Nguyen New Residence to the hearing of March 16, 2007 at the request of the Board of Architectural Review.

III. MINUTES: Gray moved, seconded by Ferguson-Ettinger and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Donaldson and Froscher absent) to approve the Minutes of February 9, 2007.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 06BAR-00000-00292 Bengtson Residence Remodel/Addition Mission Canyon
06LUP-00000-01050 (Jim Heaton, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ridgeline- Urban

Request of AB Design Studio, agent for the owners, Dr. Vern and Hannah Bengtson, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00292 for **final approval on consent of a residence addition of approximately 413 square feet, attached workshop of approximately 100 square feet, and exterior decks of approximately 242 square feet, and enclosure and expansion of a carport to be a detached garage of approximately 716 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,813 square feet and detached garage of approximately 397 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a .56 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-171-058, located at **2817 Exeter Place** in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/05/07)

ACTION: C. Roberts moved, seconded by Gray and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Donaldson and Froscher absent) to grant final approval on consent of 06BAR-00000-00292.

V. BAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: None.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None.

VII. STANDARD AGENDA:

Site Visit

1. 06BAR-00000-00302 Rothbard New Residence Carpinteria
(Tina Ryder, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro Canyon

Request of Britt Jewett, architect for the owner, Michael Rothbard, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00302 for **a site visit of a new residence of approximately 8,800 square feet (replacing the existing residence), a detached garage of approximately 400 square feet, a second detached garage of approximately 850 square feet, a cabana of approximately 800 square feet, a pool, and motor court.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 3,700 square feet, second residence of approximately 2,500 square feet and a garage/barn of approximately 1,000 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 1,700 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 22 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-270-006, located at **3215 Foothill Road** in the Carpinteria/Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/19/07)

Project received a site visit and was reviewed for further conceptual review later this day.

Site Visit

2. 06BAR-00000-00285 Burns New Residence and Detached Garage Santa Barbara
06LUP-00000-00285 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ridgeline - Rural

Request of Amy Taylor, architect for the owner, Paul R. Burns, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00285 for **site visit of a new residence of approximately 2,085 square feet and detached garage of approximately 690 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 3,204 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1 acre parcel zoned 40-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 021-020-008, located at **2700 Gibraltar Road** in the Santa Barbara area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/19/07)

Project received a site visit and was reviewed for further conceptual review later this day.

3. 06BAR-00000-00316 Santa Barbara Botanic Garden Mission Canyon
06NEW-00000-00138 (Alex Tuttle, Planner) **Jurisdiction: DVP**

Request of B3 Architects, architect for the owner, Santa Barbara Botanic Garden, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00316 for **conceptual review of an expansion of facilities that would result in a net increase of approximately 37,631 relative to existing development distributed among 22 new buildings. Existing development on the site includes 30 buildings totaling approximately 39,130 square feet.** The proposed project will require approximately 12,393 cubic yards of cut and approximately 8,210 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 78 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-051-004, located at **1212 Mission Canyon Road** in the Mission Canyon area, Second Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return with site visit for further conceptual review. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:

COMMENTS:

- a. **BAR endorses review of the project design by the Mission Canyon Architectural Review Committee. Plans should be widely available to the public.**
- b. **Presentation of the project was careful, however, due to the scope of the project, the BAR needs more time and input to provide truly cogent comments. To wit, a site visit, or a series of site visits will be necessary following erection of story poles. Planner to arrange. Site visit to include stops at sensitive public vistas.**
- c. **BAR requested additional clarification as to the following:**
 - **Statistics re., what is existing and what is proposed.**
 - **Information on public views into the site (specifically calling out which buildings and site areas are visible and from where).**
 - **Site context: applicant to provide aerial showing the entire area within approx. one mile of the garden site boundaries to get understanding of area density and relationship of other development to the Garden.**
 - **Extent of existing and proposed paving (roadways and paths).**
 - **Grading quantities involved.**
 - **Clarification of interrelationship between pedestrian circulation and landscaping.**
 - **Night lighting.**
- d. **BAR takes note of all of the comments on fencing. Fencing is the garden's immediate face to the community and its design needs to be complementary to the architectural style of the garden as a whole. Fencing must receive architectural consideration. Return with information and options for an architectural solution to the fencing issue.**
- e. **Initial design response:**
 - **Style and architectural direction are good – in keeping with the character.**
 - **Appreciate reuse of Gane House, however, building adjacent to Gane House may be too close. Reexamine relationship. Site visit with story poles will help to illuminate this issue.**
 - **Use of consistent materials is desirable; however, design must differentiate site walls from buildings. BAR is concerned about the apparent mass of the façade that has a three story appearance.**
 - **Concerned about the density of development. In order to address the density of the proposed development, BAR needs more information about the surrounding neighborhood to make neighborhood compatibility findings.**
 - **Residences must receive the same level of design consideration as the “public buildings” on the west side of the garden.**
- f. **BAR would like to start reviewing the landscaping now as well as the architecture.**
- g. **Planner not to take project to the PC prior to full scrutiny by the BAR and conceptual comments that the project is ready for preliminary approval.**

4. 06BAR-00000-00285 Burns New Residence and Detached Garage Santa Barbara
06LUP-00000-00285 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ridgeline - Rural

Request of Amy Taylor, architect for the owner, Paul R. Burns, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00285 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,085 square feet and detached garage of approximately 690 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 3,204 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1 acre parcel zoned 40-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 021-020-008, located at **2700 Gibraltar Road** in the Santa Barbara area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/19/07)

Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:

COMMENTS:

- a. **BAR agrees that the site is "sacred" however, the literal application of Jordanian temple iconography to the project site is unacceptable particularly given the site's prominent location and broad visibility from much of the south coast.**
- b. **The proposed building expresses materials of different place and time and is reminiscent of a "folly", which, in an historic garden, would have been a private landscape element.**
- c. **Project must be redesigned to speak to the unique character and highly visible nature of the Gibraltar Road site.**
- d. **A low-slung architecture is acceptable.**
- e. **The proposed 17 foot retaining wall behind the house and proposed grading are, however, unacceptable; the site is constrained and the design will need to conform such that the house works with the natural terrain, stepping into and growing from the site, rather than substantially altering the site to create a flat graded pad, itself developed from edge to edge.**
- f. **The currently proposed plan is overly aggressive for this constrained site.**
- g. **Consideration of any design on this lot should take the required 100 foot fire clearance into account.**
- h. **The elevation, excessive grading, and highly visible retaining walls required for the proposed garage and guest house are not consistent with the natural environment.**
- i. **Restudy. The project has not changed since the previous BAR meeting on the project and comments from the previous meeting have not been addressed.**
- j. **The driveway going up to the site is a highly visible scar on the landscape; proposed project will need to include mitigation.**

Toro Canyon/Summerland/Carpinteria Areas

5. 06BAR-00000-00302 Rothbard New Residence Toro Canyon
(Tina Ryder, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro Canyon

Request of Britt Jewett, architect for the owner, Michael Rothbard, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00302 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 8,800 square feet (replacing the existing residence), a detached garage of approximately 400 square feet, a second detached garage of approximately 850 square feet, a cabana of approximately 800 square feet, a pool, and motor court.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 3,700 square feet, second residence of approximately 2,500 square feet and a garage/barn of approximately 1,000 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 1,700 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 22 acre parcel zoned AG-I-10 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-270-006, located at **3215 Foothill Road** in the Carpinteria/Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/19/07)

Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. Applicant to return for preliminary/final approval. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:

COMMENTS:

- a. **Positive changes were made to the architecture in response to BAR comments; architect is to be commended.**
- b. **Current architectural design presents an estate in an area appropriate for estates; home is well sited.**
- c. **Landscaping, however, requires level of attention given to architecture.**
- d. **Highway 192 allows for broad views across the site; reconsider walling off the view from the public with the myoporum hedge and instead consider providing privacy around the proposed new home through appropriate placement of landscape materials and allowing public views to continue to sweep south across the site.**
- e. **Return for preliminary/final before the full board.**

**6. 05BAR-00000-00241 Bell New Residence and Attached Garages Toro Canyon
05LUP-00000-01235 (Lisa Hosale, Planner) Jurisdiction: Ridgeline –Rural**

Request of Harrison Design Assoc., architect for the owners, James and Karen Bell, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00241 **for preliminary approval of a new residence of approximately 6,754 square feet with attached garages of approximately 1,722 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 1,258 square feet and an accessory structure of approximately 60 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 2,000 cubic yards of cut and fill to be determined. The property is a 2.25 acre parcel zoned 10-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-090-017, located at **3091 Hidden Valley Lane** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/28/05 & 3/10/06)

ACTION: Donaldson moved, seconded by Ferguson-Ettinger and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Froscher absent) to grant preliminary approval. Applicant to return for final approval at the meeting of March 16, 2007. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:

COMMENTS:

- a. **Good progress on design.**
- b. **Appreciate dark tones of exterior materials however, some reservation about green doors.**
- c. **Return for final before the full board with lighting (include specs) and landscape plans.**

**7. 05BAR-00000-00185 (Previously 04BAR-00000-00311 McMenamin) Toro Canyon
Sutherland Residence Addition and Remodel**

05CDP-00000-00074 (Previously 04CDP-00000-00140) (Holly Bradbury, Planner) Ridgeline: Rural
Request of Susan Sherwin, agent for the owner, Toni Sutherland, to consider Case No. 04BAR-00000-00311 **for preliminary/final approval on consent of a guest house of approximately 795 square feet, understory storage room (under guesthouse) of approximately 247 square feet and new deck area of approximately 1,096 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 2,028 square feet and garage of approximately 615 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of grading. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-140-058, located at **428 Toro Canyon Road** in the Toro Canyon area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/14/05, 2/25/05, 4/8/05, 4/15/05, 10/14/05 & 1/05/07)

ACTION: Gray moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Donaldson and Froscher absent) to drop 05BAR-00000-00185 from the agenda at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

- 8. 06BAR-00000-00176 Nguyen New Residence Summerland**
06CDP-00000-00078 (Holly Bradbury, Planner) Jurisdiction: Summerland
Request of Richele Mailard, agent for the owner, David Nguyen, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00176 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,200 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 154 cubic yards of cut and approximately 415 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 7,506 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-152-062, located at **180 Valencia Road** in the Summerland area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 9/15/06, 11/03/06 & 1/05/07)
- ACTION: Gray moved, seconded by C. Roberts and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Donaldson and Froscher absent) to continue 06BAR-00000-00176 to the meeting of March 16, 2007 at the request of the SBAR. See Agenda Status Report.**
- 9. 06BAR-00000-00257 Beach Club Family Trust New Residence Carpinteria**
06CDP-00000-00044 (Nicole Mashore, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro Canyon
Request of James V. Coane & Associates, architect for the owners, Beach Club Family Trust, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00257 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,602 square feet and attached underground garage and basement of approximately 868 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require no fill and approximately 575 cubic yards of cut. The property is a 14,743 square foot parcel zoned 8-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-390-019, located at **3280 Beach Club Road** in the Carpinteria area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/17/06 & 1/05/07)
- Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:**
- COMMENTS:**
- a. Architect is to be commended for reaching out to the HOA and responding positively to BAR comments.
 - b. Lower largest shed roof, shorten eave and eliminate clerestory as windows provide no views and adequate light is already designed to penetrate home.
 - c. Generally, simplifying the roofline would be appropriate.
 - d. Siting of the home is acceptable.
 - e. Erect story poles for individual BAR drive by site visits. Story poles and tape to define largest and highest shed roof.
- 10. 06BAR-00000-00259 Beach Club Family Trust New Residence Carpinteria**
06CDP-00000-00045 (Nicole Mashore, Planner) Jurisdiction: Toro Canyon
Request of James V. Coane & Associates, architect for the owners, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00259 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,941 square feet and with attached garage of approximately 626 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 40 cubic yards of cut and approximately 60 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 17,440.32 square foot parcel zoned 8-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 005-390-021, located at **3270 Beach Club Road** in the Carpinteria area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/17/06 & 1/05/07)
- Project received further conceptual review only, no action was taken. The following comments were made by the Board of Architectural Review members present for this project:**
- COMMENTS:**
- a. The natural topography of the site is an anomaly of the neighborhood. Therefore, the BAR supports and recommends more grading to ensure that the house is more compatible with the neighborhood.
 - b. Style of architecture, low slung and horizontal, is appropriate to the site.
 - c. Consider simplifying roofline and eliminating clerestory.

- d. While the project site may be remnant of natural topography, it is today an anomaly in the neighborhood.**
- e. In order for this infill project to fit into the neighborhood, the site needs to be graded further down.**
- f. If it is graded further down, plate heights and clerestory could be appropriate.**
- g. Plaster should not dominate exterior materials.**
- h. Erect story poles for individual BAR drive by site visits based on the latest design. Story poles and tape to define largest and highest shed roof.**

There being no further business to come before the Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Pamela Ferguson-Ettinger moved, seconded by Chris Roberts, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Robin Donaldson and Valerie Froscher absent) that the meeting was adjourned until 9:00 A.M. on Friday, March 2, 2007 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 5:30 P.M.