

COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA



**MONTECITO
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of October 11, 2010**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Michele Michaelson	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Bill Palladini	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Sam Maphis	Alice McCurdy	- Supervising Planner
Derrick Eichleberger		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:16 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Marsh Zilles	
Michele Michaelson	
Bill Palladini	
Donald Nulty	Vice Chair
Anthony Spann	- Chair
Derrick Eichleberger	
Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Allen Bell	- Planner III

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT:

Sam Maphis

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 15

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT:

**Consent item #3- Aptaker Demo/New Two Story Single Family Dwelling & Attached Garage.
The project description incorrectly states that the project is a three story SFD, it is a two story SFD.**

III. MINUTES: Eichelberger moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 5-0-1 (Maphis absent, Palladini abstained) to approve the Minutes of September 27, 2010.

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:

VI. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1.	10BAR-00000-00120	Melnick Patio Enclosure	116 Miramar Lane
	10CDP-00000-00067	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Dennis Thompson, agent for the owners, Peter & Lani Melnick, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00120 for **final approval on consent of an addition (patio enclosure) of approximately 202 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 2,876 square feet and a legal nonconforming duplex consisting of a dwelling approximately 523 square feet and a dwelling of approximately 397 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 399 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a .54 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-264-008, located at **116 Miramar Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/23/10, 9/13/10)

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Nulty and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Maphis absent) to grant preliminary/ final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00067.

C-2.	10BAR-00000-00127	Patrick Addition	230 Hot Springs Road
	10LUP-00000-00347	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Kam Bhogal, agent for the owners, Russ Patrick, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00127 for **final approval on consent of an addition to an existing single story dwelling of approximately 448 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 2,156 square feet, and a detached garage of approximately 640 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a .41 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-103-001, located at **230 Hot Springs Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 9/13/10)

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Nulty and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Maphis absent) to grant final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00127.

C-3.	10BAR-00000-00078	Aptaker Demo/New Three Story Single Family Dwelling & Attached Garage	671 Buena Vista Dr.
	10LUP-00000-00277	(Kimberley McCarthy Planner, 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jeff Shelton, architect for the owners, Pat & Evan Aptaker, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00078 for **preliminary/final approval on consent of a new three story single family residence with the first floor being approximately 3,847 square feet, the second floor being approximately 2,086 square feet with a third story element of approximately 180 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 700 square feet .** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1380 square feet, the second story being approximately 1,207 and an attached garage of approximately 736 square feet, (all to be demolished). The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.03 acre foot parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-100-014, located at **671 Buena Vista Dr.** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/17/10, 7/26/10, 8/23/10, 9/27/10)

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Nulty and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Maphis absent) to grant preliminary/ final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00078.

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:

Michele Michaelson had a member of the public has her why the MBAR did not project the proposed plans for the audience members to see while the plans are being reviewed. Bill Palladini stated that there were several obstacles one being that the room was not presently equipped to handle

VI. STAFF UPDATE

STANDARD AGENDA:

FINAL APPROVAL

1. **10BAR-00000-00105** **Lewis Demo, New SFD and Garage** **260 Bonnie Lane**
10LUP-00000-00284 (Brian Banks Planner, 568-3559) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Valerie Froscher architect for the owners, Peter & Naila Lewis, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00105 for **final approval of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 2,637 square feet, the second floor being approximately 1,794 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 784 square feet and a separate detached garage of approximately 504 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 2,158 square feet and a detached garage of approximately 492 square feet, to be demolished. The proposed project will require approximately 342 cubic yards of cut and approximately 295 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .97 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-430-011, located at **260 Bonnie Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/12/10, 8/9/10, 8/23/10, 9/13/10, 9/27/10)

Public Comment:
Bill Jones

MBAR Comments:

1. **The agent clarified that the project includes planting a 48-inch box Coast Live Oak (*Quercus agrifolia*) in the upper right corner of the property. (MBAR noted the species, size and location of this tree on the landscape plan.)**
2. **MBAR appreciated that the applicant had moved the garage further away from Bonnie Lane since the project received preliminary review.**

ACTION: Eichelberger moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Spann abstained) to grant final approval of 10BAR-00000-00105 with the following condition:

1. **The landscaping shall include a 48-inch box Coast Live Oak (*Quercus agrifolia*) planted in the upper right corner of the property.**

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

2. **10BAR-00000-00111** **Case Study Properties, LLC New Two Story** **628 Romero Canyon**
10LUP-00000-00268 **SFD, Garage & Accessory Structure** (Lisa Martin, Planner 568-2032) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Robert Irvine, agent for the owner, William Hefner, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00111 for **preliminary/final approval of a demolition of the existing dwelling and reconstruction of a new two-story 2,195 square foot residence, a new pool cabana of approximately 800 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 800 square feet, and miscellaneous hardscaping including low walls, a pergola, fountain and trellis.**The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family residence of approximately 838 square feet and an accessory structure of approximately 641 square feet (to be demolished). The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a .97 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-060-007, located at **628 Romero Canyon Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/26/10, 8/23/10, 9/27/10).

Public Comments:
Robert Eldridge

MBAR Comments:

1. The applicant explained that the proposed project includes up-lighting for three oak trees, shown as “D” on the Lighting Plan (Sheet L 4.0).
2. Several MBAR members questioned the use of up-lighting for trees. They noted that the standard conditions of approval require exterior night lighting to be of low intensity, low glare design, minimum height, and to be hooded to direct light downward.
3. MBAR concluded that it could not approve the proposed up-lighting for the three oak trees. However, the applicant may use appropriate down-lighting for these three trees.

ACTION: Eichelberger moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 5-0-1 (Maphis absent, Spann abstained) to grant final approval of 10BAR-00000-00111 with the following conditions:

1. The project shall not include the up-lighting for the three trees shown as “D” on the Lighting Plan (Sheet L 4.0). However, the applicant may use down-lighting in these three trees provided the lighting is (1) limited to a total maximum of 35 watts of incandescent lighting per tree or, alternatively, 13 watts of fluorescent lighting or one watt of LED lighting per tree; (2) hooded, shielded and directed downward; and (3) limited to a maximum height of 20 feet above the finished grade.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| 3. | 10BAR-00000-00142 | Satullo/Yamashita Addition & Remodel | 1774 Glen Oaks Drive |
| | 10LUP-00000-00376 | (Nicole Mashore, Planner 884-8068) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of John Cordic , agent for the owners, Salvatore Satullo & Allen Yamashita, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00142 for **conceptual review of a 962 square foot second story addition and 645 first floor addition to an existing residence.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story residence of 2,789 square feet, 679 square foot garage and 559 square foot pool room (approximately 2,311 square feet to be demolished). The proposed project will require approximately 30 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1.22 acre foot parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor’s Parcel Number 007-191-003, located at **1774 Glen Oaks Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

MBAR Comments:

1. The residence appears too large (mass, bulk and scale). The proposed large chimney contributes to the structure’s large mass and competes with other architectural elements. The structure has lost its charm and character.
2. Pare down the volume of the project; modulate the architecture in the French architectural tradition. The applicant needs to return with project renderings.
3. MBAR expressed concerns regarding the skylight, including that the skylight is large and prominent, protrudes above the peak of the roof, and faces south and, therefore, would be visible and would result in glare as seen from Glen Oaks Lane.
4. The landscaping uses few native plants. The kitchen garden will look poor during part of the year. This garden should be more discrete and the project should include a more traditional entry landscape plan. The applicant needs to return with a preliminary landscape plan.
5. The project needs to be reviewed by the Glen Oaks Association before returning to MBAR.
6. MBAR will conduct a site visit with story poles after receiving written comments on the project from the Glen Oaks Association.

Project received comments only (Maphis absent). No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review with a site visit with story poles.

4. **10BAR-00000-00143** Booth New
Single Family Dwelling & Garage 1795 Fernald Point Lane
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Nueman Mendro Andrulitus, architect for the owner, Loren Booth, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00143 for **conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1,820 square feet and the second floor being approximately 857 square feet and a detached garage of approximately 483 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 220 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .27 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-380-030, located at **1795 Fernald Point Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

Public Comments:

John Klink (spoke and submitted letter)

MBAR Comments:

1. **MBAR requested the staff planner to verify the size of the parcel (gross square feet) and calculate the recommended maximum house net floor area (square feet).**
2. **The architecture is acceptable. However, the applicant should restudy the parapet heights.**
3. **The house, or possibly the second level, should be moved away from the ocean (north).**
4. **The walls along the property boundaries should be reduced from 8 feet to 5 feet in height.**
5. **The applicant needs to provide a preliminary landscape plan at the next review.**
6. **The applicant should return with a study of the windows of John Klink's residence (neighbor, adjoining residence to the west) to help evaluate potential privacy issues.**
7. **MBAR will conduct a site visit with stakes, but without story poles.**

Project received comments only. (Maphis absent) No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review with a site visit with story poles on the same day.

5. **10BAR-00000-00034** Richmond Remodel, Demolition and Addition 134 Santa Elena Lane
10CDH-00000-00007 (Julie Harris, Planner 568-3518) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Zimmerman Architects, architect for the owner, Mark Richmond, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00034 for **further conceptual review of a remodel of 1,400 square feet, demolition of 23 square feet and addition of approximately 1,053 square feet to the existing single family residence. The new addition will include 899 square feet on the 1st floor addition and a loft of 159 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family residence of approximately 1,893 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 321 square feet. The proposed project will require less than 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 50 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.40-acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-244-003, located at **134 Santa Elena Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 3/8/10)

MBAR Comments:

- 1. The project does not meet the neighborhood compatibility guidelines. The height is too tall and volume is too large compared to surrounding structures in the neighborhood. A primary concern is the appearance of the front of the house as seen from the street.**
- 2. The solution involves more than creating hips. The height and volume of the house need to be reduced.**

Project received comments only. (Maphis absent) No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review.

**6. 10BAR-00000-00032 K-Corp/Carter New Single Family Dwelling 1140 High Road
10CDP-00000-00069 (Julie Harris, Planner 568-3518) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Kyle Carter, owner, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00032 for **further conceptual review of a new two story single family residence with the first floor being approximately 2,972 square feet, the second floor being approximately 588 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 625 square feet.** The parcel is vacant with gateposts and a low perimeter wall with historic merit. The proposed project will require approximately 216 cubic yards of cut and 210 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.95-acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-162-037, located at **1140 High Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/16/10 6/21/10)

Public Comments:

J' Amy Brown (High Road Neighborhood Association)

MBAR Comments:

- 1. MBAR requested the staff planner to send the Montecito Association a complete set of project plans. Several members also asked the staff planner to clarify whether parking is allowed in the rear setback.**
- 2. The siting and size of the residence are acceptable.**
- 3. MBAR members expressed two different opinions regarding the architectural style of the proposed residence. Several members felt that the architectural style should be revised to be compatible and in character with the historic structures on the adjoining properties. However, the majority concluded that the proposed architecture style is acceptable and that the applicant now needs to develop the architectural details of the residence, including, but not limited to, windows, doors, and rafter tails.**
- 4. MBAR members agreed that a site visit with story poles would help them appreciate the character of the neighborhood and resolve differences regarding the architectural style of the proposed residence.**

Project received comments only. (Maphis absent, Spann abstained) No action taken..Applicant to return for further conceptual review with a site visit with story poles.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Palladini moved, seconded by Michaelson, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Spann & Maphis absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, October 25, 2010 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:00 P.M.

G:\GROUP\PC_STAFF\WP\MONTECITO\MBAR\MINUTES\2010\10-11-10 MINUTES.DOCX