



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

**MONTECITO
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of September 19, 2011**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Bill Palladini	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Sam Maphis	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Derrick Eichelberger	Anne Almy	- Supervising Planner
Dave Mendro		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 2:00 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Mendro
Marsha Zilles
Bill Palladini
Donald Nulty - Vice Chair
Anthony Spann - Chair
Sam Maphis
Derrick Eichelberger
Sharon Foster - MBAR Secretary
Anne Almy - Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 20

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

- I. PUBLIC COMMENTS:** J' Amy Brown stated that the Historic Landmark Advisory Commission is accepting bids until September 30, 2011 for historical surveys of properties in Montecito.
- II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT:** Maphis moved, seconded by Mendro and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Zilles absent) to adopt the following change to the agenda:

Item #1 (Tea Fire Bermant New SFD) was dropped from the Standard Agenda.
- III. MINUTES:** Eichelberger moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Zilles absent) to approved the minutes of August 29, 2011.
- V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:** On September 6, 2011, Bill Palladini attended the Montecito Associations Land Use Committee meeting where they discussed the Creighton project. The biggest issue for the neighbors is the two accessory structures. The Montecito Associations Land Use Committee was generally supportive.

The proposed project intended to be built on the former site of the Turk Hessellund nursery, located at 1255 Coast Village Road, will be heard at the Montecito Planning Commission on October 26, 2011.

A community hearing was held on the Montecito YMCA. Issues raised included compatibility, traffic, and the use and amount of the proposed development.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None

STANDARD AGENDA:

1. **08TEA-00000-00045**
11BAR-00000-00134 **Tea Fire Bermant New Single Family Dwelling** **810 Coyote Road**
11LUP-00000-00312 (Brian Banks, Planner 568-3559) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Brian Poliquin, architect for the owner, Andrew Bermant, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00134 for **further conceptual review of a two story single family dwelling, with the first floor being approximately 1,805 square feet (gross), the second floor being approximately 1,488 square feet (gross) and a attached garage of approximately 502 square feet (gross).** There are no structures currently on the property. The proposed project will require approximately 370 cubic yards of cut and approximately 200 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-0700-028, located at **810 Coyote Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/29/11)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Mendro, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Zilles absent) to drop 11BAR-00000-00134 from the agenda at the request of the applicant. See Agenda Status Report.

FINAL APPROVAL

2. **11BAR-00000-00138** **Gunner Commercial Exterior Changes**
Conceptual Preliminary/Final Approval **525 San Ysidro Road**
11SCD-00000-00011 & 11LUP-00000-00320 (Julie Harris, Planner 568-3518) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Richard Gunner, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00138 for **conceptual review and preliminary/final approval of exterior alterations including doors, windows, roofs & exterior colors, finishes and materials of buildings previously approved by 07BAR-00000-00202 and 08DVP-00000-00028 and changing the sign type for Building D from a wall sign previously approved by 08OSP-00000-00003 to an under canopy sign.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Commercial and Retail buildings of approximately 14,193 square feet (net) of which 6,896 square feet (net) are currently under construction. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.42 acre parcel zoned CN and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-200-083, located at **525 San Ysidro Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

MBAR Comments:

1. Prefer subtle changes to original design.

ACTION: Zilles moved, seconded by Maphis and carried by a vote of 7-0 to grant preliminary/final approval of 11BAR-00000-00138.

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

3. **10BAR-00000-00032** **K-Corp/Carter New Single Family Dwelling** **1140 High Road**
10CDP-00000-00069 (Julie Harris, Planner 568-3518) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Kyle Carter, owner, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00032 for **further conceptual/preliminary approval of a new two-story single family residence with the first floor being approximately 3,132 square feet, the second floor being approximately 359 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 739 square feet (all areas net sq. ft.). The project includes a new pergola-type garden structure of approximately 525 square feet and 7.5 feet tall, and a new 5' tall**

wrought iron fence. The parcel is vacant with gateposts and a low perimeter wall of historic merit, which will remain in place. The proposed project will require approximately 216 cubic yards of cut and 210 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.95-acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-162-037, located at **1140 High Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/16/10 6/21/10, 10/11/10, 10/25/10, 1/24/11, 8/29/11)(Appearing: Kim & Kyle Carter, Bill Wolf, Charles McClue)

Public Comments:

1. J' Amy Brown
2. Julie Ann Hybert
3. Kellam De Forest

MBAR Comments:

1. **Design has come a long way.**
2. **Appreciate earth tone color of roofing. Restudy roof color and choose one color, preferably in brown.**
3. **Lighting is low profile and has lots of screening therefore it is acceptable.**
4. **Appreciate work toward satisfying neighborhood concerns.**
5. **Commend applicant for moving house to the west.**
6. **Avoid smooth trowel stucco.**

ACTION: Mendro moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 6-0-1 (Spann recused) to grant preliminary approval of 11BAR-00000-00032. The project may return for final review before the full board with color and materials boards as well as architectural details, including light fixtures.

**Prescott New Residence
and Cabana**

- | | | |
|--|--|---|
| 4. 08BAR-00000-00273
10LUP-00000-00109 | Prescott New Residence
and Cabana
(Allen Bell, Planner 568-2033) | 1496 E. Mountain Drive
Ridgeline: Yes |
|--|--|---|

Request of Jeremy Roberts, agent for the owner, John K. Percy, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00273 for **further conceptual review/preliminary approval of a two-story single-family residence of approximately 7,184 square feet, attached garage of approximately 775 square feet, attached cabana of approximately 460 square feet, pool of approximately 550 square feet, and driveway of approximately 1,100 linear feet.** (Statistics are gross area.) No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed residence and driveway will require approximately 6,500 cubic yards of cut and approximately 1,500 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 4.17-acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-060-044, located at 1496 E. Mountain Drive in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Owner has a pending Lot Line Adjustment to reduce the size of the parcel from 4.17 to 3.15 acres, Case No. 09LLA-00000-00011.) (Continued from 1/23/09, 9/27/10)

Public Comments:

- Fred Clough
John Maas - letter
Greg Wilson

MBAR Comments:

1. **The MBAR feels that the overarching land use issue of whether the lot is buildable remains unresolved despite staff assurances that they can make the required finding of approval requiring that the project is consistent with all applicable policies. In particular, the MBAR is concerned that the project is inconsistent with policy requiring minimization of grading. Hence the MBAR is reluctant to opine on the design of the project and would prefer to have land use direction from the MPC first.**
2. **Very difficult site leading to a proposal which appears to go to extremes to achieve build out. Project team has performed lots of work to solve the problem of building on this lot, but the**

solution, including a long driveway with retaining walls along the east side of the lot to the building pad at the top of the lot, appears unacceptable.

3. Findings that the MBAR may not be able to make include F, G and H:

- *Site layout, orientation and location of structures and signs will be in an appropriate and well designed relationship to one another, and to the environmental qualities, open spaces, and topography of the site with consideration for public views of the hillsides and the ocean and the semi-rural character of the community as viewed from scenic view corridors as shown on Figure 37, visual Resources Map in the Montecito Community Plan EIR (92-EIR-03).*
- *Adequate landscaping will be provided in proportion to the project and the site with due regard to preservation of specimen and landmark trees, existing vegetation, selection of plantings that are appropriate to the project and that adequate provisions have been made for the maintenance of all landscaping.*
- *Grading and development is designed to avoid visible scarring and will be in an appropriate and well designed relationship to the natural topography with regard to maintaining the natural appearance of the ridgelines and hillsides.*

4. Question is, what is reasonable development: can alternative constraints (e.g., Fire Department requirements) be relaxed to relocate road and home lower down in lot. Applicant urged to reexamine program in context. Need to see alternative design solutions to roadway and new pad. Return with schematics.

The project received comments only. The project is to return for further conceptual review. Dave Mendro will do a site visit to better understand the site since he was not on the Montecito Board of Architectural Review at the time of the original site visit.

5.	11BAR-00000-00051	Clay New Guesthouse	1431 East Mountain Drive
	11LUP-00000-00243	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Kelly Teich, architect for the owners, Walt & Linne Clay, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00051 for **preliminary approval of new guest house of approximately 800 square feet**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family dwelling of approximately 5,075 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 471 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 2.34 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-100-016, located at **1431 East Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/9/11, 7/11/11, 8/29/11)

MBAR Comments: None

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Mendro and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant preliminary approval of 11BAR-00000-00051. The project may return for final on consent with the consent of the planner.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

6.	11BAR-00000-00018	A. H. Living Trust New Second Floor Addition and Remodel	2255 Featherhill Road
	11LUP-00000-00047	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Peter Kavoian, architect for the owners, A.H. Living Trust, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00018 for **further conceptual review/preliminary approval of an addition and remodel to the existing first floor of the existing residence of approximately 2,971 square feet and a second floor addition to the existing residence of approximately 2,378 square feet**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single story residence of approximately 2,749 square feet, a

detached 4 car garage of approximately 900 square feet, a guesthouse of approximately 800 square feet, a utility shed and pool house. The proposed project will require less than 50 cubic yards of cut and less than cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.27 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-060-004, located at **2255 Featherhill** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/28/11, 8/8/11)

Public Comments:

1. Pat Moser
2. Ted Moser
3. Sally Wilcox
4. Philip Wilcox - Letter

MBAR Comments:

1. **Some MBAR members are concerned about the compatibility of the proposed approximately 7,000 square foot Italianate style estate home inserted into the small, modest Featherhill neighborhood. MBAR agrees that Featherhill is a neighborhood in transition; while some members believe design should be modified to achieve rustic, Provencal style others accept the style.**
2. **Concerned that proposed height will cause a precedent in the neighborhood for future buildout and remodels. The project is too tall; lower entire structure and take height out of the tower. May need to eliminate the tower.**
3. **Restudy north elevation.**
4. **Restudy orientation of the proposed new curb cut.**
5. **Previous comments stand with the exception of the tower comments and comments on the driveway.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review/ preliminary approval with the approval of the planner.

7.	<u>11BAR-00000-00049</u>	<u>Landfried Two Story Addition</u>	<u>822 Chelham Way</u>
	11LUP-00000-00165	(J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of John & Ilze Landfried, architect & owners, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00049 for **further conceptual review/preliminary approval of an addition to a story single family dwelling, with the first floor addition being approximately 4 square feet, and the second story addition being approximately 346 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling of approximately 1,878 square feet, with the first floor being approximately 691 square feet (one square foot to be demolished) the second story being approximately 1187 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.22 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-111-005, located at **822 Chelham Way** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/25/11, 6/6/11)

Public Comments:

- Brad Stevens- Letter
Julie McLeod- Letter

MBAR Comments:

1. **Parking is successful; new stairway access works well.**
2. **Study landscape screening along south property line at parking area.**
3. **Restudy second story windows on north elevation to ensure privacy to and from neighboring house.**

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Zilles and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant preliminary approval of 11BAR-00000-00049. The project may return for final approval with the approval of the planner.

Dehlsen Family Trust Guest House Addition

8. 11BAR-00000-00139 and New Pool Equipment Structure 1420 East Valley Road
11LUP-00000-00324 (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Peter Becker, architect for the owner, James Dehlsen, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00139 for **conceptual review of a new guest house of approximately 800 square feet, a new pool equipment structure of approximately 155 square feet and pergolas of approximately 940 square feet. The project includes validation of the unpermitted conversion of the carport into a garage of approximately 760 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 8,270 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 760 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 115 cubic yards of cut and approximately 25 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.24 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-200-008, located at **1420 East Valley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

MBAR Comments:

- 1. Planner to ascertain whether structure is a landmark.**
- 2. Garage is fine.**
- 3. Proposed new structures seems in keeping with the house; scale is appropriate.**
- 4. Will need a landscape plan to ensure screening of area.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for preliminary/final approval with the approval of the planner.

9. 11BAR-00000-00144 Clemens Additions and Exterior Remodel 1060 Channel Drive
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Tom Ochsner, architect for the owner, Barton Clemens, Trustee, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00144 for **conceptual review of new detached garage of approximately 650 square feet, a new sun room/ study of approximately 323 square feet, a new bedroom of approximately 530 square feet, a gallery of approximately 341 square feet, a dining room of approximately 426 square feet, exterior remodel to the existing tower and cabana.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family dwelling of approximately 4,238 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 868 square feet, a cabana of approximately 365 square feet, and a guest house of approximately 852 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 16 cubic yards of cut and no grading. The property is a 1.40 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-283-006, located at **1060 Channel Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

MBAR Comments:

1. Positive comments regarding design.
2. Proceed to MPC for land use action.

The project received comments only. Nulty & Eichelberger absent from the discussion. The project may return for preliminary approval with the approval of the planner and after it is heard by the Montecito Planning Commission.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Zilles moved, seconded by Maphis, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Nulty & Eichelberger absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 2:00 P.M. on Monday, October 10, 2011 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:42 P.M.

