

COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA



MONTECITO BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of August 8, 2011

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Bill Palladini	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Sam Maphis	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Derrick Eichelberger	Anne Almy	- Supervising Planner
Dave Mendro		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:00 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Mendro
Marsha Zilles
Bill Palladini
Donald Nulty - Vice Chair
Anthony Spann - Chair
Sam Maphis
Derrick Eichelberger
Sharon Foster - MBAR Secretary
Anne Almy - Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 15

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

- I. **PUBLIC COMMENTS:** J'Amy Brown announced that the Historic Landmarks Advisory Committee is seeking proposals for the 2012 annual Historical Properties Survey. The survey area falls within the Montecito Community Pan boundaries. Written proposals shall be submitted to Santa Barbara County Planning and Development at 103 East Anapamu Street or e-mailed to Anita Hodosy-McFaul at ahodosy@co.santa-barbara.ca.us no later than September 30, 2011. More detailed proposal requirements are posted at County of Santa Barbara website www.s.countyplanning.org/boards/hlac.
- II. **AGENDA STATUS REPORT:** The agenda had been revised to add: Maxwell Addition Remodel Driveway and Circular Motor Court and the project Sturgess New SFD and Attached Garage/Artist Studio was removed.
- II. **MINUTES:** Nulty moved, seconded by Zilles and carried by a vote of 5-0-2 (Eichelberger & Maphis abstained) to approve the minutes of July 25, 2011.

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None

CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 11BAR-00000-00116	Brentwood Westridge Trust	788 San Ysidro Road
11LUP-00000-00255	Addition & New Garage (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owners, Brentwood Westridge Trust, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00116 for a **preliminary/final approval on consent of addition to an existing master suite of approximately 425 square feet, an addition of approximately 193 square feet to the existing garage for the conversion of the area into additional habitable space, and a new detached garage of approximately 400 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 2,436 square feet, a pool house of approximately 955 square feet and a garage/laundry room of approximately 463 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 21 cubic yards of cut and approximately 21 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.34 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-150-001, located at **788 San Ysidro Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/25/11) (Appearance by Diana Kelly, Robert Foley)

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Eichelberger, and carried by a vote of 6 -0-1 (Nulty abstained) to grant preliminary/final approval on consent.

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: Chairman Spann announced that the MBAR hearings will now begin at 2:00 P.M. additionally; site visits will be limited to no more than three per meeting due to the time constraint.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None

STANDARD AGENDA:

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

1. 11BAR-00000-00104	Maxwell Addition, Remodel	1163 Summit Road
11CDP-00000-00044	Driveway and Circular Motor Court (Nicole Lieu Planner 886-8068)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Richard Starnes, agent/architect for the owners, Jack Maxwell, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00104 for **further conceptual review/ preliminary approval of interior alterations to combine two legal nonconforming dwellings and a garage into a 2,765 SF single family residence, conversion of legal nonconforming residence to an 873 SF attached residential second unit with an attached 800 SF pool cabana, construction of a new pool and a new 800 SF detached garage, new covered loggia, a new driveway, new entry with circular motor court.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family residence with 3 attached separate living units and attached garage of approximately 4,756 square feet total and attached tower of approximately 144 square feet and a detached 4th residential unit of approximately 318 square feet will be demolished. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 50 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .91 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-162-038, located at **1163 Summit Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/11/11, 7/25/11) (Appearance by Richard Starnes)

Public Comments:

Jane Dyruff,
J' Amy Brown,
Kellam De Forest

MBAR Comments:

1. **Project is going in the right direction; comments held to conceptual due to need for peer review of historic resource letter.**
2. **Planner to verify Fire Department requirements; MBAR encourages applicant to request relief from the 80 foot diameter turn around requirement.**
3. **Project appropriately provides room within the Summit Road right of way for pedestrian movement. Consider relocating the olives to provide even more room along Summit Road.**
4. **Irrigation within the Summit Road right of way should be designed as a drip system to obviate the possibility of landscape irrigation adversely affecting perimeter landscape wall.**
5. **Appreciate new design at existing entry which isolates the existing pillars from new landscape perimeter wall.**
6. **Appreciate that new gate is located further into the site allowing more room for an idling car out of the right of way; restudy and simplify gate design.**

Project received comments only. Spann abstained from the discussion. The project may return for further conceptual review/preliminary approval with the approval of the planner.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|--|---------------------------|
| 2. | 10BAR-00000-00122 | Kohansamad Addition | 140 Butterfly Lane |
| | 10CDP-00000-00077 | (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Joseph Pazcoguin, agent for the owner, Albert Kohansamad, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00122 for **further conceptual review of a remodel and addition to a two story single family dwelling of approximately 650 square feet to the first floor and 550 square feet to the second floor and an attached garage of approximately 400 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling with the first floor consisting of 950 square feet and the second floor being 650 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.26 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-163-018, located at **140 Butterfly Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/23/10, 5/23/11)

The project was not heard. Applicant was not present. Story poles were not up as requested. Spann abstained from the discussion. The project is to return for further conceptual review. A site visit and story poles have been requested again.

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|---|------------------------------|
| 3. | 11BAR-00000-00018 | A. H. Living Trust New Second Floor
Addition and Remodel | 2255 Featherhill Road |
| | 11LUP-00000-00047 | (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Peter Kavonian, architect for the owners, A.H. Living Trust, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00018 for **further conceptual review of a addition and remodel to the existing first floor of the existing residence of approximately 2,971 square feet and a second floor addition to the existing residence of approximately 2,378 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single story residence of approximately 2,749 square feet, a detached 4 car garage of approximately 900 square feet, a guesthouse of approximately 800 square feet, a utility shed and pool house. The proposed project will require less than 50 cubic yards of cut and less than cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.27 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 155-060-004, located at **2255 Featherhill** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/28/11)
(Appearance by Peter Kovian)

Public Comments:

Phillip and Sally Wilcox,
Pat Moser

Barry Berkus,
George Krebs,
Maynard Moser,

Letters:

Gary Gulbransen
Sara Wilcox
Tom Mulane
Carol Glasser
George and Alice Krebs
Robert and Irma Bijou

MBAR Comments:

1. **Challenging project: architecturally handsome, however, in terms of neighborhood compatibility, proposal may be too large a leap from the modest homes in the existing neighborhood regardless of the size of the lot.**
2. **8% FAR coverage is improved from previously larger proposal; however, MBAR reserves approval of the coverage with the expectation of design changes to ensure neighborhood compatibility.**
3. **Main concern is the scale and visibility of the proposed tower element which is architecturally dominant and unique to the neighborhood; restudy to reduce both the height and width of the tower.**
4. **House seems to push up and out of the site with numerous stairways needed to facilitate indoor/outdoor living; lower house into the site.**
5. **Concern about proximity of proposed new entry drive with existing drive; restudy and narrow the aprons.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review/preliminary approval. If the tower is redesigned, it will be need to be story poled with a site visit prior to the next conceptual/preliminary review to view the story poled tower.

	Creighton New Single Family Dwelling	
4. 11BAR-00000-00101	Pool and Cabana	789 Rockbridge Road
11LUP-00000-00238	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Peter Becker, architect for the owner, Mary Jane Creighton, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00101 for **further conceptual review of a new single family dwelling of approximately 3,808 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 831 square feet a covered loggia of approximately 161 square feet, a pool cabana of approximately 365 square feet and an accessory structure of approximately 365 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 600 cubic yards of cut and approximately 600 cubic yards of fill or will not require grading. The property is a 1.73 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-080-002, located at **789 Rockbridge Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 7/11/11) (Appearance by Peter Becker & Tom Hensen)

Public Comments:

Tom Bollay
Kelam DeForest
Frieda Vizcerra
Paulette Bermant
Sheila McInnity

MBAR Comments:

1. **MBAR recognizes that the site is unique; retention of historic fountain and staircases is commendable.**

2. **MBAR appreciates the model.**
3. **Good job on low profile architecture; refreshingly elegant; details will be key to the success of this project.**
4. **MBAR appreciates how project elements step down with the site; consider further lowering pool and pavilions. Return with confirmation about whether the project program includes the pavilions.**
5. **There is a lack of agreement amongst MBAR members as to whether the interior courtyard surrounding the historic fountain is appropriately sized; consider restudying to reduce width of courtyard by eight to ten feet.**
6. **There is general concern about the amount of pavement proposed along the east side of the lot. Consider separating the service from the main entry with the goal of reducing paving in that area.**
7. **Landscape plan needs to be developed; Landscape to follow unit of historicity in respect to materials and views of the site. Need to be very clear about private spaces vs. public views corridors into the site. Screening of private areas will be necessary. Controlling public views and access will be equally important to the landscape plan.**
8. **Leave area for pedestrians to walk along the Rockbridge Road right of way adjacent to the site.**
9. **Not in favor of a mixed perimeter hedge.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for preliminary approval with the approval of the planner.

- | | | | |
|-----------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 5. | 08BAR-00000-00041 | Southard Storage Shed | 1410 Greenworth Place |
| | 07CDP-00000-00074 | (J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Larry Graves, architect for the owner, Nancy Southard, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00041 for **further conceptual review of storage shed of approximately 500 square foot.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 3,044 square feet, an artist studio of approximately 824 square feet and storage shed of approximately 460 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading or fill. The property is a 1 acre parcel zoned I-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-109-005, located at **1410 Greenworth Place** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/7/08, 7/11/11) (Appearance by Larry Graves & Sally Hanseth)

MBAR Comments:

1. **Planner to provide memo regarding land use context prior to next conceptual review.**
2. **Plans need to be based on a site survey.**

The project received comments only. It was determined that certain issues that the MBAR had specifically requested to be addressed had not been. The project is to return for further conceptual review.

- | | | | |
|-----------|--------------------------|--|-----------------------------|
| 6. | 11BAR-00000-00122 | Morfit Guesthouse Pergola,
Wall, New Driveway and Landscape Changes | 786 Hot Springs Road |
| | 11LUP-00000-00289 | (Brian Banks, Planner 568-3559) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Tim Barber, agent for the owners, Mason & Anna Morfit, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00122 for **conceptual review of an addition of a new attached pergola of approximately 169 square feet to an existing guesthouse, demolish an existing deck on the guesthouse and to be replaced with a new stone terrace and a new driveway and landscape changes.**

The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling of approximately 4,063 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 655 square feet, and a detached guesthouse of approximately 919 square feet. The proposed project will not require any cut and approximately 18 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.46 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-090-053, located at **786 Hot Springs Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.
(Appearance by **Tim Barber, Xavier Beltran, Scott Menzel, Sidney Baumgarten**)

MBAR Comments:

1. Design is acceptable.

The project received comments only. The project may return for preliminary/ final approval on consent with the approval of the planner.

7. 09BAR-00000-00202	Coleman New Single Family Dwelling & Detached Garage	869 San Ysidro Lane
	(No Planner Assigned)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Syndi Souter, agent for the owners, Tom & Polly Coleman, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00202 for **further conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling, with the first floor being approximately 3,769 square feet, the second floor being approximately 3,194 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 515 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 697 square feet and a guesthouse of approximately square feet.** No structures exist on the property. The proposed project will require approximately 923 cubic yards of cut and approximately 418 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.86 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-110-055, located at **869 San Ysidro Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/4/10)
(Appearance by **Gordon Slater & Syndi Souter**)

Public Comment:

Robert Lyons
Kellam DeForest

MBAR Comments:

1. Some concern about the 15% FAR overage; return with neighborhood FAR study.
2. House appears a bit massive given its size and proximity to the roadway.
3. Appreciate the idea of retaining the orchard and using as a design concept for decorative landscape design.
4. Re., landscaping in front yard: leave area within right of way for pedestrian movement along San Ysidro Road.

Project received comments only. Tony Spann abstained from the discussion. The project may return for further conceptual review. A site visit and story poles have been requested once a planner has been assigned.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Eichelberger moved, seconded by Zilles, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Mendro, Palladini & Spann absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, August 29, 2011 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:20 P.M.

