

COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA



MONTECITO BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of July 11, 2011

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Bill Palladini	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Sam Maphis	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Derrick Eichelberger	Anne Almy	- Supervising Planner
Dave Mendro		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:00 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Mendro
Marsha Zilles
Bill Palladini
Donald Nulty - Vice Chair
Anthony Spann - Chair
Sam Maphis
Derrick Eichelberger
Sharon Foster - MBAR Secretary
Anne Almy - Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None

REPORTERS: None

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 20

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT: None

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Palladini moved, seconded by Zilles and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Maphis & Nulty absent) to: adopt the following changes to the agenda.

C-1. 11BAR-00000-00068- Westmont College Exterior Remodel & Deck Removal - Continued to the July 25, 2011 MBAR meeting at the request of the applicant.

C-2. 11BAR-00000-00074- Montesano Garage Conversion to a Single Family Dwelling - Continued to the July 25, 2011 MBAR meeting at the request of the applicant.

Item 6. 11BAR-00000-00100- Usher Demo & New Single Family Dwelling - Continued to the July 25, 2011 MBAR meeting at the request of the applicant due to the use of an incorrect address in the noticing procedure.

IV. MINUTES: Palladini moved, seconded by Zilles and carried by a vote of 4-0-1 (Mendro & Eichelberger absent, Maphis abstained) to approve the Minutes of June 20, 2011

V. MONTECITO CONSENT AGENDA:

	Westmont College	
C-1. 11BAR-00000-00068	Exterior Remodel and Deck Removal	915 La Paz Road
11LUP-00000-00207	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Pete Ehlen, architect for the owners, Westmont College, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00068 for **final on consent of an addition to the existing single family dwelling of approximately 130 square feet, removal of the existing wood siding to be replaced with plaster and a portion of the deck to be removed.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: an existing single family dwelling of approximately 1,613 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 413 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 15 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1.39 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-080-006, located at **915 La Paz Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/23/11)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Palladini, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Mendro & Eichelberger absent) to continue 11BAR-00000-00068 to the MBAR meeting of July 25, 2011. See Agenda Status Report.

	Montesano Garage Conversion	
C-2. 11BAR-00000-00074	to a Single Family Dwelling	633 Oak Springs Road
11LUP-00000-00208	(Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Dawn Sherry, architect for the owner, Gene Montesano, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00074 for **final approval on consent of a conversion of an existing garage of approximately 467 square feet to a new single family dwelling, construction of a detached new covered parking area of approximately 470 square feet and a new tennis court with a wall of approximately 10 feet high and a fence of approximately 10 feet high, outside of the setback.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two car garage of approximately 467 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.12 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-090-038, located at **633 Oak Springs Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 6/6/11, 6/20/11)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Palladini, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Mendro & Eichelberger absent) to continue 11BAR-00000-00074 to the MBAR meeting of July 25, 2011. See Agenda Status Report.

VI. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:

On June 7, 2011 Bill Palladini & Dave Mendro attended the Montecito Association Land Use Committee meeting in regard to the Montecito Y.M.C.A. The LUC's primary concerns were that:

- 1. The Architecture looks institutional**
- 2. Neighborhood compatibility may not be achieved**
- 3. The project, if completed, will increase the intensity of the use of the site**
- 4. The proposed FAR will be three times what is there now**
- 5. The project may contribute to the urbanization of San Ysidro Road**

6. The Y.M.C.A does not have the funds to build the project and the project is therefore at question.

Dave Mendro was present at the LUC's review of the Coast Village Road mixed use project by Brian Cearnal. The meeting went well.

VII. STAFF UPDATE: None

STANDARD AGENDA:

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

- | | | | |
|-----------|--------------------------|--|---------------------------------|
| 1. | 11BAR-00000-00051 | Clay New Guesthouse | 1431 East Mountain Drive |
| | 11LUP-00000-00243 | (Kimberley McCarthy, Planner 568-2005) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Kelly Teich, architect for the owners, Walt & Linne Clay, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00051 for **preliminary approval of new guest house of approximately 800 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family dwelling of approximately 5,075 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 471 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 2.34 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-100-016, located at **1431 East Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/9/11)

Public Comment:

Maria Moreau

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Zilles, and carried by a vote of 7-0 to continue the project to a future MBAR meeting. The MBAR member's heard comments from the neighbor and stated that photos of the neighbor's house should be taken and ready for the next time the project is scheduled.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

- | | | | |
|-----------|--------------------------|---|-------------------------|
| 2. | 11BAR-00000-00015 | 880 Picacho Lane Trust SFD Demo
Rebuild & Remodeled Guesthouse | 880 Picacho Lane |
| | 11LUP-00000-00100 | (Megan Lowery. Planner 568-2517) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Bree Medley, agent for the owners, 880 Picacho Lane Trust, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00015 for **further conceptual review of a new two story single family residence, with the first floor being approximately 3,700 square feet, the second floor being approximately 2,925 square feet, a basement of approximately 2,600 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 670 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 840 square feet and a detached two-story garage/office space of approximately 1,670 square feet total.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling residence of approximately 5,630 square feet, and attached garage of approximately 738 square feet, all to be demolished, a detached garage of approximately 1,670 square feet and an accessory structure of approximately 840 square feet, to be remodeled. The proposed project will require approximately 1,256 cubic yards of cut, 433 cubic yards of fill, and 823 cubic yards of export. The property is a 2.62 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-100-034 & 011-100-035, located at **880 Picacho Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/28/11, 5/23/11) (Appearing: Suzanne Elledge, Bree Medley, Phil Parton, Josh Monroy)

Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest

J' Amy Brown
Michael Towbes- Letter

1. **MBAR appreciates applicant's responses to MBAR comments.**
2. **Good improvements including reworking the entry court; appreciate retention of oaks.**
3. **Architecture has developed well.**
4. **Appreciate that property line fence is pulled back from right of way allowing for pedestrian movement along the roadway and that creek area will undergo restoration.**
5. **Consider creating direct access from terraced rear patios to lawn area; appreciate reduction in lawn area.**
6. **Planner to consider need for historic resources report analyzing the project.**

The project received comments only. The project can return for preliminary approval with the planner's approval.

3. **08BAR-00000-00041** **Southard Storage Shed** **1410 Greenworth Place**
07CDP-00000-00074 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Larry Graves, architect for the owner, Nancy Southard, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00041 for **further conceptual review of a storage shed of approximately 500 square foot**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 3,044 square feet, an artist studio of approximately 824 square feet and storage shed of approximately 460 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading or fill. The property is a 1 acre parcel zoned I-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-109-005, located at **1410 Greenworth Place** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/7/08)

Public Comments:
Bill & Bonnie Braastad

- MBAR Comments:**
1. **Planner to confirm permit status of all structures on site.**
 2. **Planner to ensure project plans are based on survey of the property.**

The project received comments only. The applicant was not present. MBAR reviewed the project and took and heard the neighbors comments.

4. **11BAR-00000-00101** **Creighton New Dwelling, Pool and Cabana** **789 Rockbridge Road**
11LUP-00000-00238 (Nicole Lieu, Planner 884-8068) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Peter Becker, architect for the owner, Mary Jane Creighton, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00101 for **conceptual review of a new single family dwelling of approximately 3,808 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 831 square feet a covered loggia of approximately 161 square feet, a pool cabana of approximately 365 square feet and an accessory structure of approximately 365 square feet**. No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 600 cubic yards of cut and approximately 600 cubic yards of fill or will not require grading. The property is a 1.73 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-080-002, located at **789 Rockbridge Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.(Appearing: Peter Becker)

Public Comment:
Kellam de Forest

The project received comments only. The project can return for further conceptual review. Site visit and story poles are requested.

5. **11BAR-00000-00104** Maxwell Addition, Remodel
Driveway and Circular Motor Court 1163 Summit Road
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Richard Starnes, agent/architect for the owners, Jack Maxwell, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00104 for **conceptual review of a conversion of an existing garage to a living space of approximately 1,686 square feet, a new detached garage of approximately 800 square feet, conversion of an existing residential unit of 1,673 square feet to a pool house of 800 square feet and a second residential unit of 873 square feet, interior remodel of existing residence, a new covered loggia, a new pool and spa, a new driveway, new entry with circular motor court.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family residence with 3 attached separate living units and attached garage of approximately 4,756 square feet total and attached tower of approximately 144 square feet and a detached 4th residential unit of approximately 318 square feet will be demolished. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 50 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .91 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-162-038, located at **1163 Summit Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.(Appearing: Jack Maxwell, Richard Starnes, Tim Hazeltine, Pamela Post)

Public Comment:

Kellam de Forest
J' Amy Brown

MBAR Comments:

1. **Planner to report on 1) FAR of SFD/ARSU in relation to other SFDs in the neighborhood and 2) historic attributes of the project and impacts of the project on the historic integrity of the site as assessed in historic report and 3) HLAC comments on project.**
2. **Garage appears appropriately subservient to the main SFD.**
3. **Appreciate reuse of the historic pergola.**
4. **Reconsider use/amount of paving/hardscape on the lot; consider adding more garden space.**
5. **Great interior layout; project is going in the right direction.**
6. **Appreciate change of use, proposed clean up of site and respect being shown for the architecture.**

The project received comments only. The project is to return for further conceptual review with a landscape plan following a site visit to assess neighborhood context.

6. **11BAR-00000-00100** Usher Demo and New Single Family Dwelling 1301 East Valley Road
11LUP-00000-00237 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Kinka Usher, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00100 for **conceptual review of project description of approximately a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being of approximately 4,720 square feet, the second floor being 2,696, a basement of approximately 1,985 square feet, a detached garage of approximately 450 square feet, an attached guesthouse of approximately 900 square feet and a detached accessory structure of approximately 800 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: The existing house to be demolished. The proposed project will require approximately 300 cubic yards of cut and approximately 300 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.83 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as

Assessor's Parcel Number 011-050-021, located at **1301 East Valley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Palladini, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Mendro & Eichelberger absent) to continue 11BAR-00000-00068 to the MBAR meeting of July 25, 2011. See Agenda Status Report.

7. **11BAR-00000-00103** **Mitchel Addition** **180 Santo Tomas**
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of David Chase, agent for the owners, Hank & Mari Mitchel, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00103 for **conceptual review of an addition to the already existing single family dwelling of approximately 353 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family residence of approximately 2,280 square feet, and an attached garage of approximately 440 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.37 acre parcel zoned 0-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-182-004, located at **180 Santo Tomas** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearing: David Chase, Paul Olsen)

Public Comment:
Kellam de Forest

The project received comments only. The project can return for preliminary/final approval on consent with planner approval and Land Use Permit has been applied for.

8. **11BAR-00000-00107** **MPJC Ventures LLC New Two Story** **1395 Danielson Road**
Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage Lot #1
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Sophie Calvin, agent for the owners, MPJC Ventures, LLC, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00107 for a **conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1,555 square feet and the second floor being 945 approximately square feet and an attached garage of approximately 420 square feet.** No other structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.247acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-304-013 & 009-304-014, located at **1395 Danielson Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearing: Sophie Calvin, Josh Monroy, Jim Congdon)

Public Comments:
Kellam de Forest
David Eldred
Richard Barr

MBAR Comments:

1. **Conceptually, layout of project appears to be acceptable. However, some concern about the siting of the homes which leaves an expansive paved area comprising common and private driveways in the central portion of the lot surrounding the fig tree. Also some concern that street views into the lot will be overly influenced by the numerous garage doors. Need to see better delineation of common open space areas in the development.**
2. **Mass, bulk and scale appear appropriate but materials and details will be critical to keep the project from appearing like a tract development. While the MBAR will be looking for variety in the architectural details and materials of each home, there is concern about mixing roofing materials on any given home.**
3. **Need a grading and drainage plan that shows how drainage will be handled on site. MBAR encourages the use of rain gardens and other low impact details in this regard.**

4. Lot specific comment:

- **The fence located on the north side of the home is awkward in its adjacency to the house: restudy.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review following a site visit with story poles describing each home.

- 9. 11BAR-00000-00108 MPJC Ventures LLC New Two Story
Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage Lot #2 1385 Danielson Road
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Sophie Calvin, agent for the owners, MPJC Ventures, LLC, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00108 for a **conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1,470 square feet and the second floor being 1,030 approximately square feet and an attached garage of approximately 483 square feet.** No other structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.246 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-304-013 & 009-304-014, located at **1385 Danielson Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearing: Sophie Calvin, Josh Monroy, Jim Congdon)

Public Comments:

Kellam de Forest
David Eldred
Richard Barr

MBAR Comments:

- 1. Conceptually, layout of project appears to be acceptable. However, some concern about the siting of the homes which leaves an expansive paved area comprising common and private driveways in the central portion of the lot surrounding the fig tree. Also some concern that street views into the lot will be overly influenced by the numerous garage doors. Need to see better delineation of common open space areas in the development.**
- 2. Mass, bulk and scale appear appropriate but materials and details will be critical to keep the project from appearing like a tract development. While the MBAR will be looking for variety in the architectural details and materials of each home, there is concern about mixing roofing materials on any given home.**
- 3. Need a grading and drainage plan that shows how drainage will be handled on site. MBAR encourages the use of rain gardens and other low impact details in this regard.**
- 4. Lot specific comment:**
 - **Tower constitutes third story given deck use area and is therefore not acceptable. Eliminate from project.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review following a site visit with story poles describing each home.

- 10. 11BAR-00000-00109 MPJC Ventures LLC New Two Story
Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage Lot #3 1387 Danielson Road
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Sophie Calvin, agent for the owners, MPJC Ventures, LLC, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00109 for a **conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling of approximately 2,500 square feet, with the first floor being approximately 2,081 square feet and the second floor being 419 approximately square feet and an attached garage of approximately 700 square feet.** No other structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.260 acre parcel

zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-304-013 & 009-304-014, located at **1387 Danielson Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearing: Sophie Calvin, Josh Monroy, Jim Condon)

Public Comments:

Kellam de Forest
David Eldred
Richard Barr

MBAR Comments:

1. **Conceptually, layout of project appears to be acceptable. However, some concern about the siting of the homes which leaves an expansive paved area comprising common and private driveways in the central portion of the lot surrounding the fig tree. Also some concern that street views into the lot will be overly influenced by the numerous garage doors. Need to see better delineation of common open space areas in the development.**
2. **Mass, bulk and scale appear appropriate but materials and details will be critical to keep the project from appearing like a tract development. While the MBAR will be looking for variety in the architectural details and materials of each home, there is concern about mixing roofing materials on any given home.**
3. **Need a grading and drainage plan that shows how drainage will be handled on site. MBAR encourages the use of rain gardens and other low impact details in this regard.**
4. **Lot specific comment:**
 - **Garage doors face street and will be very prominent. Need to mitigate visual impact.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review following a site visit with story poles describing each home.

- MPJC Ventures LLC New Two Story**
11. **11BAR-00000-00110 Single Family Dwelling and Attached Garage Lot #4 1393 Danielson Road**
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Sophie Calvin, agent for the owners, MPJC Ventures, LLC, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00110 for a **conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1,919 square feet and the second floor being 581 approximately square feet and an attached garage of approximately 527 square feet.** No other structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.247acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-304-013 & 009-304-014, located at **1393 Danielson Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearing: Sophie Calvin, Josh Monroy, Jim Condon)

Public Comments:

Kellam DeForest
David Eldred
Richard Barr

MBAR Comments:

1. **Conceptually, layout of project appears to be acceptable. However, some concern about the siting of the homes which leaves an expansive paved area comprising common and private driveways in the central portion of the lot surrounding the fig tree. Also some concern that street views into the lot will be overly influenced by the numerous garage doors. Need to see better delineation of common open space areas in the development.**

2. **Mass, bulk and scale appear appropriate but materials and details will be critical to keep the project from appearing like a tract development. While the MBAR will be looking for variety in the architectural details and materials of each home, there is concern about mixing roofing materials on any given home.**
3. **Need a grading and drainage plan that shows how drainage will be handled on site. MBAR encourages the use of rain gardens and other low impact details in this regard.**
4. **Lot specific comment:**
 - **Restudy varied roof heights of north elevation.**

The project received comments only. The project may return for further conceptual review following a site visit with story poles describing each home.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Zilles moved, seconded by Eichelberger, and carried by a vote of 6-0-1 (Maphis abstained) that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, January 24, 2011 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:08 P.M.