



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

MONTECITO BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of June 6, 2005

Marsha Zilles		Santa Barbara County
Michele Michaelson		Montecito Community Hall & Library
Raymond Ketzel		1469 East Valley Road
Donald Nulty	Vice Chair	Santa Barbara, California 93108
Anthony Spann	- Chair	(805) 568-2000
Sam Maphis		
Peter Edwards		
Kim Yanagihara	- MBAR Secretary	
Julie Harris	- Planner III	

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:00 P.M., in the Montecito Community Hall & Library 1469 East Valley Road, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michele Michaelson	
Raymond Ketzel	
Donald Nulty	Vice Chair
Anthony Spann	- Chair
Peter Edwards	
Kim Yanagihara	- MBAR Secretary
Julie Harris	- Planner III

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: Maphis and Zilles

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 17±

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Ketzel moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to adopt change to agenda. (Maphis, Nulty and Zilles absent)

Item No. 2 – Webb continued to June 20, 2005.

III. MINUTES: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote 4 to 0 to approve the Minutes of May 23, 2005. (Maphis, Nulty and Zilles absent)

IV. MONTECITO CONSENT AGENDA

The Representatives of the following items should be in attendance at this MBAR Meeting by 2:45 P.M.

C-1.	<u>05BAR-00000-00109</u>	Eiler Single Family Dwelling Addition	318 Avila Way
	05LUP-00000-00513 (Lisa Martin, Planner 568-2032)		Ridgeline: N/A

Request of R. J. Spann, architect for the owner, Richard J. Eiler, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00109 for **preliminary/final on consent of addition to a single family dwelling of approximately 225 square feet, a new roof and exterior alterations.** The following structure currently exist on the parcel: a single family residence of approximately 3,580 square feet. The property is a .091 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-280-031, located at **318 Avila Way** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/9/05)

ACTION: Ketzal moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to grant preliminary/final approval on consent of 05BAR-00000-00109. (Maphis and Zilles absent/Spann abstained)

	LaWarre Single Family Dwelling	
C-2.	05BAR-00000-00110 Addition and Remodel	550 Periwinkle Lane
	05LUP-00000-00474 (Lisa Martin, Planner 568-2032)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Vadim M. Hsu, architect for the owner, William LaWarre, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00110 for **preliminary/final on consent of a remodel and addition of approximately 1,143 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family dwelling of approximately 1,323 square feet and detached accessory structure of approximately 188 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 50 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.54 square foot parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-200-071, located at **550 Periwinkle Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/9/05)

ACTION: Ketzal moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to grant preliminary/final approval on consent of 05BAR-00000-00110. (Maphis, Nulty and Zilles absent)

C-3.	05BAR-00000-00001 Stahl Single Family Dwelling Addition	248 Dawlish Place
	05LUP-00000-00527 (Amy Trester, Planner 568-3116)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Valerie Froscher, architect for the owner, Sandy Stahl to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00001 for **preliminary/final on consent of an addition to an existing residence of approximately 430 square feet.** The following structures currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,830 square feet and garage of approximately 400 square feet. The property is a .33 acre parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-131-013, located at **248 Dawlish Place** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/24/05)

ACTION: Ketzal moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to grant preliminary/final approval on consent of 05BAR-00000-00001. (Maphis, Nulty and Zilles absent)

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: None

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None

STANDARD AGENDA:

The Representatives of the following items should be in attendance at this MBAR Meeting by 3:00 P. M.

FINAL APPROVAL

**Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, LLC San Ysidro Ranch Cottages
Cottage Remodels (Outlook, Magnolia, Oak, Lower Hill, Kennedy, Geranium, Rose,
Acacia, Bougainvillea, Coleman) New Gatehouse/Restroom and Realignment**

1. **04BAR-00000-00286 of Roads/Parking 900 San Ysidro Lane**
05RVP-00000-00001 (Lisa Hosale, Planner, 568-2007) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Ken Mineau, Appleton & Associates, architects for the owner, Ty Warner Hotels & Resorts, LLC, to consider Case No. 04BAR-00000-00286 for **final approval of remodeling plans to the existing Outlook, Magnolia, Oak, Lower Hill, Kennedy, Geranium, Rose, Acacia, Bougainvillea, Coleman Cottages of approximately 8,621 total square feet. The project also includes construction of a new gatehouse, restroom, and realignment of the internal roads and parking areas.** The following currently exists on the parcel: the San Ysidro Ranch Hotel. The proposed project will require approximately 1,100 cubic yards of cut and 1,700 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 19.77 acre parcel zoned C-V and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-050-026, located at **900 San Ysidro Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/11/05 and 5/9/05) (Ken Mineau and Susan McLaughlin appeared)

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 to grant final approval of 04BAR-00000-00286 with the following conditions (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Conditions:

- MBAR wants to see trail signs, entry signage and letter of approval of trail relocation from Montecito Trails Foundation/Park Department on consent agenda

Neighbor Comments:

John Venable, Montecito Trails Foundation – concerned that his office not contacted regarding trail relocation as previously conditioned; visited site last week and current temporary trail is not usable and there needs to be signage to direct trail users through property.

Ralph Baxter – wants to be sure that Park Department reviews and approves relocation of trail.

Webb Two-Story Residence/Attached Garage/Detached

2. **03BAR-00000-00243 Garage/Pergola and Guesthouse 1460 East Mountain Drive**
04LUP-00000-00152 (Peter Lawson, Planner, 568-2021) Ridgeline: Urban

Request of Tom Oschsner, architect for the owner, Bobby Webb, to consider Case No. 03BAR-00000-00243 for **final approval of a new two-story residence of approximately 7,000 square feet, attached garage of approximately 812 square feet; detached garage of approximately 800 square feet, new pergola of approximately 798 square feet, a cabana of 174 square feet and guesthouse of approximately 800 square feet.** No structures currently exist on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 5,300 cubic yards of cut and approximately 3,050 cubic yards of fill. The property consists of 2 legal parcels 1 acre each zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Numbers 011-060-005 and -009, located at **1460 East Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/6/03, 7/12/04, 3/28/05 and 6/6/05)

ACTION: Ketzal moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to continue to June 20, 2005.

3. **04BAR-00000-00248 Waitt Residential Additions 875 Knollwood Drive**
04LUP-00000-00985 (Richard Kentro, Planner, 568-3509) Ridgeline: Applicable

Request of Tracey Burnell architect for the owners, Mr. and Mrs. Waitt, to consider Case No. 04BAR-00000-00248 for **revised final approval of additions of approximately 1,662 square feet to an existing two-story residence of approximately 7,579 square feet, removal of a 741 square foot pool cabana, expansion of an existing terrace, construction of a circular entry court, construction of an approximately 49 square foot tool shed, and construction of various hardscape features.** The proposed project will require approximately 660 cubic yards of cut and 246 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.75 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-070-043, located at **875 Knollwood Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/25/04, 11/8/04, 11/22/04, 12/20/04 and 1/10/05) (Tracey Burnell and Bob Pester appeared)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Nulty and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 to continue to June 20, 2005. (Mapis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Re-study attic dormers over garage (too big as proposed) – should be smaller or removed altogether
- Re-study materials on gym portion – consider plaster or brick
- Other changes are ok although overall has lost some of the finer details that were in previous approval

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

4. **02BAR-00000-00109 Damron Single Family Dwelling Addition 1076 The Fairway Road**
02CDH-00000-00015 (Adrienne Domas, Planner 568-2002) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Bob Easton, architect for the owner, Jim Damron, to consider Case No. 02BAR-00000-00109 for **preliminary/final approval of construction of a new 1,072 square foot attached garage to an existing 8,306 square feet residence.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 8,306 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 607 cubic yards of cut and approximately 220 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.94 acre parcel zoned I-E-I and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-282-032, located at **1076 The Fairway Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/6/03, 11/3/03 and 3/28/05) (Bob Easton and Jim Damron appeared)

ACTION: Ketzler moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 to grant preliminary approval of 02BAR-00000-00109. (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Final on Consent ok

5. **04BAR-00000-00199 Dobson Meadows Residence Addition/Remodel and Addition to New Guest House 706 Park Lane**
04LUP-00000-00794 (Amy Trester, Planner 568-3116) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Victor Schumacher, architect for the owner, Art Novak, to consider Case No. 04BAR-00000-00199 for **preliminary/final approval of an addition of approximately 805 square feet to the existing residence and an addition of approximately 196 square feet to an existing guest house.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a residence of approximately 5,814 square feet, attached garage of approximately 700 square feet and guest house of approximately 450 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 3.51 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-100-015, located at **706 Park Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 9/13/04) (Victor Schumacher appeared)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4 - 0 - 1 grant preliminary approval of 04BAR-00000-00199. (Maphis and Zilles absent/Ketzel abstained)

6. **05BAR-00000-00020 Tolan Single Family Dwelling Addition 1153 High Road**
05CDP-00000-00009 (Richard Kentro, Planner 568-3509) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of William Cooper, architect for the owners, Peter and Leslie Tolan, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00020 for **preliminary approval of an addition to a single family residence of approximately 970 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,680 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 230 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.21 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-163-007, located at **1153 High Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/28/05, 4/11/05, 5/9/05 and 5/23/05) (William Cooper and Peter Tolan appeared)

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Ketzel and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 to grant preliminary approval of 05BAR-00000-00020. (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Conditions

- Show landscape screening for west property line and trees on site to remain

Comments:

- Looks nice – appreciates the work to accommodate neighbors' privacy needs

Neighbor Comments

J' Amy Brown – Would like to know if privacy issue now settled, not so much concerned with seeing some of building as not having windows look down into her property. Would like to see existing hedge stay, perhaps taller. Requests construction parking to be accommodated on site and if can't be done at least not park on street in front of her residence.

7. **05BAR-00000-00115 Barrack Single Family Dwelling Addition 288 Hot Springs Road**
05LUP-00000-00506 (Holly Bradbury, Planner 568-3577) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owners, Thomas J. Barrack, Jr., to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00115 for **preliminary/final approval of additions to the first and second floor of approximately 2,468 square feet and a trellis terrace of approximately 1,550 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 5,481 square feet, garage of approximately 1,334 square feet, guest house of approximately 774 square feet and service area of approximately 100 square feet. The property is a 3.28 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-130-037, located at **288 Hot Springs Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 5/23/05) (Robert Foley appeared)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 to grant preliminary/final approval of 05BAR-00000-00115. (Maphis and Zilles absent/Nulty abstained)

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. **05BAR-00000-00128 Rutherford Remodel and Addition 1374 Danielson Road**
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Susette Naylor, architect for the owners, John and Lynn Rutherford, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00128 for **conceptual review of a remodel to Unit A and a new second story to Unit B of approximately 1,100 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Unit A is approximately 1,017 square feet and Unit B is approximately 1,100 square feet. The property is a 0.224 acre parcel zoned 7-R-2 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Numbers 009-

570-006 and -005, located at **1374 Danielson Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Susette Naylor and Lynn Rutherford appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Do neighborhood study – focus on Danielson to Olive Mill, 101 to railroad tracks; show documentation of two stories and size of duplexes.
- Only two of the five members present would support Spanish style in this neighborhood.
- Spanish style is too heavy for this neighborhood, which is more cottage-like, beachy.

Neighbor Comments:

Bonnie Kent (letter) – strongly objects to second story, oppressive. Concerned added area would be used to increase number of living units and parking already a problem in neighborhood.

9. **05BAR-00000-00124 Adams Addition and Interior Remodel 202 Olive Mill Road**
05LUP-00000-00546 (Alice Daly, Planner 568-2059) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jason Grant, architect for the owner, Elyse Adams, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00124 for **conceptual review of a new three (3) car garage of approximately 851 square feet, artist studio of approximately 792 square feet and remodel of residence of approximately 3,451 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 2,626 square feet and guest house of approximately 575 square feet. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-640-003, located at **202 Olive Mill Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Jason Grant and Elyse Adams appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Re-study north elevation, second story dormer, consider a shed-style
Otherwise looks fine

The Representatives of the following items should be in attendance at this MBAR Meeting by 4:15 P. M.

10. **05BAR-00000-00136 Beach Cabana, Single Family Dwelling Addition and Retaining Wall 1504 E. Mountain Drive**
05LUP-00000-00573 (Holly Bradbury, Planner 568-3577) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Vadim Hsu, architect for the owner, Patrick Beach, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00136 for **conceptual review of a cabana of approximately 933 square feet and residential addition of 127 square feet.** The following structure currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 6,643 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 0 cubic yards of cut and approximately 896 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.49 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-070-015, located at **1504 E. Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Vadim Hsu and Glen Cerny appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Re-study grading around the stone pines; re-study the new proposed lawn, perhaps less would step the grading back away from those trees
- Re-study how the retaining wall ties into the base of the cabana
- Re-study chimney transition
- Show good screening along the wall and the base of the cabana

Neighbor Comments:

Travis Logue (representing neighbor Victor Atkins) – concerned with size of cabana (notice provided gross not net area) and that with ten other construction sites in area concerned with additional development being added to this site.

11. 05BAR-00000-00142 Hamilton New Single Family Dwelling 1520 San Leandro
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Tom Smith, architect for the owners, Mike and Nancy Hamilton, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00142 for **conceptual review of a new single family residence of approximately 3,760 square feet.** The property is currently vacant. The property is a 0.87 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-203-006, located at **1520 San Leandro Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Tom Smith, Mike and Nancy Hamilton appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Provide story poles – footprint and highest points of the 1.5 story and 2 story elements.
- Work with Mr. Sanders to show what would happen on the easement that would provide access to adjacent lot to west.
- Mixed concern as to whether proposed orientation is the best for the site and neighborhood.
- Concern as to whether proposed style and materials are compatible with the neighborhood
- MBAR members to drive through neighborhood when poles go up to consider style and materials compatibility
- Recommends reducing scale to create more of a cottage feel; dormers could be lowered

Neighbor Comments:

Robin Lacks – requests that house not exceed recommended floor area for this lot, would like to see story poles, concerned with stucco finish as neighborhood is more craftsman.

Linda Ofner – what is roof height?

Candice Buergey – concerned size proposed over recommended floor area, while cabana not a part now would it be reviewed by MBAR in future, status of Monte Vista Lane and would like to see story poles.

12. 05BAR-00000-00141 Hahs Demolition/Rebuild 914 Skyview Drive
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Dennis Orr, architect for the owner, Chris Hahs, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00141 for **conceptual review for the demolition of the existing residence and construction of a new single family residence of approximately 5,030 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family residence of approximately 2,800 square feet and garage

of approximately 450 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 320 cubic yards of cut and approximately 1,650 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-192-029, located at **914 Skyview Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Dennis Orr and Chris Hahs appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Re-study the switchback driveway, thinks it might be a problem and contributes to overall height effect, tall house with tall wall 14 to 20 feet in front
- Proposal too large, twice as big as rest of neighborhood.
- Southeast portion is troubling with that tall wall so close to property line.
- Screening would be major problem.
- When return, show existing site plan, house and how it lays out; show ordinance required setbacks.
- Need to reduce grading, terrace.
- Use muted colors if staying with Spanish design.

Neighbor Comments:

Joan Patchett (to south and downslope) – Skyview Dr. very narrow street and proposed house very large, doesn't fit the scale of neighborhood. House at crest of a hill and would have a towering, looming appearance. Proposed allen block and high retaining wall is disconcerting.
John Kelley (next door) – proposed size is twice as big as existing house, his house and others on the street (at ~2,800 sq. ft.). Scope and scale including 34-ft. turret is too massive. Would like to see existing house footprint superimposed on proposal. Does not like how close to his property line the extra parking is proposed. But does like the style.
Sam Cannata – Objects to proposal, incompatible with the street and doesn't fit the area.
Mike Stowe (to south and downslope) – the big house north of Hahs already looms above, doesn't want to see anything more that sticks out like that.

	Marsted & Bermant	
13.	05BAR-00000-00099	660 Orchard Avenue
	New Single Family Dwelling	
	05LUP-00000-00455 (Adrienne Domas, Planner 568-2002)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Peikert Group, architect for the owners, Melissa Marsted and Andrew Bermant to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00099 for **further conceptual review of a new residence of approximately 2,014 square feet and garage of approximately 420 square feet.** The property is currently vacant. The proposed project will require approximately 40 cubic yards of cut and approximately 20 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.17 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-152-013, located at **660 Orchard Avenue** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District (Continued from 4/25/05 and 5/9/05) (Detlev Peikert, Andrew Bermant and Melissa marsted appeared)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. The following comments were made by the Montecito Board of Architectural Review members present for this project (Maphis and Zilles absent)

Comments:

- Straw vote on modification of front setback request – four of the five members present could support modification for the following reasons: It's a smaller neighborhood for families and this would support more useable backyard area, it would be compatible with setbacks of adjacent houses (in line with those houses), there is only a one story element up front, and it

would preserve more of the viewshed for the two most affected houses-those next door on either side.

- Four of the five members present are ok with the size, bulk and scale of the proposal presented today; one member still believes it should be smaller and of the same size as most of homes in the existing neighborhood.

Neighbor Comments:

George Petersen – wants to see neighborhood stay in working class style. Does not want to see big box houses popping up. Likes this house's design.

Tom Salman – concerned with privacy in general and wants to see designs respect that as there is a vacant lot next to his property, too.

Barbara Franklin – this lot backs up to her property. Preserve the character of the neighborhood. Appreciates that Bermant doesn't want to push his house back on his lot as it would be closer to hers.

There being on further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Members Ketzler moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 that the meeting was adjourned until 3:00 p.m. on Monday, June 20, 2005 in the Montecito Community Hall & Library, 1469 East Valley Road, Santa Barbara, California 93108.

Meeting adjourned at 6:40 P.M.