



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

MONTECITO BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPROVED MINUTES Meeting of MAY 17, 2010

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Michele Michaelson	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Bill Palladini	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Sam Maphis	Alice McCurdy	- Supervising Planner
Derrick Eichleberger		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Vice Chair, Don Nulty, at 3:16 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Marsha Zilles
Michele Michaelson
Bill Palladini
Donald Nulty Vice Chair
Sam Maphis
Derrick Eichleberger
Sharon Foster - MBAR Secretary
Alice McCurdy - Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT:

Anthony Spann - Chair

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 15

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: None

III. MINUTES: Nulty moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4-0 (Spann, Eichelberger & Zilles absent) to approve the Minutes of May 3, 2010.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA:

C-1. 10BAR-00000-00021 Gifford Garage Addition 694 Sycamore Canyon Road
10LUP-00000-00046 (Kimberley McCarthy Planner, 568-2005) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Bildsten & Sherwin, architect for the owners, Nancy & Michael Gifford, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00021 for **final approval on consent of a new detached garage of approximately 600 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family residence of approximately 4,597 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 875

square feet. The proposed project will require no cut and approximately 22 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.22 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-160-059, located at **2694 Sycamore Canyon Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/22/10)

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Maphis and carried by a vote of 4-0 (Spann, Eichleberger, Zilles absent) to grant final approval on consent of 10BAR-00000-00021.

V. **MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS. None**

VI. **STAFF UPDATE:**

Alice McCurdy and Dianne Black reviewed existing policies and regulations regarding exterior lighting. Alice provided a handout of the relevant language from the Montecito Community Plan, the Montecito Architectural Guidelines and Development Standards, the Montecito Land Use Development Code, and the department's standard nightlighting condition. The two primary guidelines the MBAR needs to follow in its review and approval of lighting plans are that exterior lighting should be minimized to maintain the semi-rural quality of the community, and that all exterior lights must be hooded. Dianne noted that the other BAR's are not allowing any uplighting, consistent with existing development standards.

STANDARD AGENDA:

1. **09BAR-00000-00065 Tea Fire - La Paz Trust SFD 999 La Paz Road**
09LUP-00000-00303 (Brian Banks, Planner, (805) 568-3559 Noel Langle, Case Manager 568-2067) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP, architect for the owner, La Paz Trust, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00065 for **final approval of a new two story residence of approximately 7,573 square feet, a finished basement of approximately 1,315 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 798 square feet, pool cabana of approximately 800 square feet, 150 sq. ft. garden shed, and various landscape, hardscape and driveway improvements.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a detached garage of approximately 1,003 sq. ft.; all other structures destroyed in the Tea Fire. The proposed project will require approximately 761 cubic yards of cut and 761 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 3.70 acre foot parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-060-003, located at **999 La Paz Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued 5/04/09, 9/14/09)(Brian Cearnal, Ann Kale, Adam Cunningham, and Martha Degasis, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. **This is an overall great project; the architecture and landscaping are magnificent.**
2. **The architecture is beautiful.**
3. **The number of lights proposed for the trees is excessive. Nightlighting has a collective impact on the community.**
4. **Agree that in one area there are a large number of lights.**
5. **As an alternative to lighting the brick/stone structure, footpath lights could be used.**
6. **The lighting proposed for the site's interior is ok, but the lighting proposed for the site's perimeter is excessive.**
7. **The landscaping and lighting seem intense. There is a lot going on, and less could be more.**
8. **The lighting is fine given the proposed wattage of 1-2 watts per fixture.**
9. **Good attention has been paid to the lighting at the periphery. It would be good to break up the areas with large numbers of lights.**

CONDITION that three lights in trees on the eastern boundary be eliminated, and two downlights in the trash area be eliminated in favor of ground lights.

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 4-0-2 (Spann absent, Eichelberger & Zilles abstained) to grant final approval of 09BAR-00000-00065.

2. **10BAR-00000-00070** **Tea Fire Rebuild** **955 La Paz Road**
10LUP-00000-00151 **Westmont College Modular Trailer** **Ridgeline: N/A**
(Alex Tuttle, Planner 568-6844)

Request of Randy Jones, agent for the owner, Westmont College, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00070 for **conceptual review, preliminary/final approval of a modular trailer of approximately 1,440 square feet to replace the Physics building lost in the fire.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Westmont College. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 50.14 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-080-007, located at **955 La Paz Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Laurel Perez and Randy Jones, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. **There could be concern about the trailer becoming permanent, but it is located on the site of a proposed permanent building.**
2. **A landscaping plan for the short term addressing issues such as walkways and screening should be prepared by a landscape architect and submitted to the planner, to be shown to a member of the MBAR.**

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Spann absent) to grant conceptual review, preliminary/ final approval of 10BAR-00000-00070.

3. **09BAR-00000-00158** **Tea Fire Stevens** **70 West Mountain Drive**
10LUP-00000-00119 **Single Family Dwelling Rebuild** **Ridgeline: N/A**
(Errin Briggs, Planner, 568-2047)

Request of Dustin Stephens, agent for the owners, Sean and Angela Stevens, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00158 for **preliminary/final approval of a new single family dwelling, with the first floor consisting of 1,580 square feet and the basement consisting of approximately 464 feet.** No structures currently exists on the property. The proposed project will require approximately 550 cubic yards of cut and approximately 200 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 6.03 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-020-024, located at **70 West Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/12/10) (Dustin Stephens, agent, Sean Stevens, and Zoe Stevens, owners, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. **The MBAR is comfortable with relying on the prior plantings coming back to provide adequate landscaping.**

ACTION: Zilles moved, seconded by Maphis and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Spann absent) to grant preliminary/ final approval of 09BAR-00000-00158.

4. **10BAR-00000-00046** **Singer Entry Foyer Addition** **612 Cowles Road**
10LUP-00000-00095 **(J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509)** **Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Sophie Calvin, agent for the owner, Maurice Singer, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00046 for **preliminary/final approval of an addition of an entry foyer of approximately 260 square feet to the existing single family dwelling and demolition of 2 existing bay windows of approximately 32 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single family dwelling of approximately 2,869 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 602 square feet, an attached second dwelling unit of approximately 549 square feet

and a storage closet of approximately 55 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 10 cubic yards of cut and approximately 10 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.0 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-170-035, located at **612 Cowles Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/5/10) (Sophie Calvin, agent, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. The project looks nice; all prior issues have been resolved.

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Spann absent) to grant preliminary/ final approval of 10BAR-00000-00046.

5. 10BAR-00000-00077 Grimm Addition 1377 East Valley Road
10LUP-00000-00163 (Brian Banks, Planner 568-3559) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Michael Stroh, architect for the owner, Charles Grimm, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00077 for **conceptual review & preliminary/final approval of a second story addition to an existing two story single family dwelling of approximately 187 square feet. The following structures currently exist on the parcel:** a two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 4,122 square feet, the second floor being approximately 1,639 square feet, two detached garages, one being approximately 468 square feet, the second garage being approximately 770 square feet, a pool cabana of approximately 320 square feet, a pool pavilion of approximately 479 square feet, a basement/storage building of approximately 672 square feet and a guesthouse of approximately 1,529 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.74 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-060-016, located at **1377 East Valley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Michael Stroh, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. Everything looks consistent with requirements.
2. The project does not raise concerns regarding landscaping; all existing landscaping to be maintained.

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Spann & Palladinin absent) to grant conceptual review, preliminary/ final approval of 10BAR-00000-00077.

6. 10BAR-00000-00078 Aptaker Demo/New Three Story Single Family Dwelling & Attached Garage 671 Buena Vista Drive
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jeff Shelton, architect for the owners, Pat & Evan Aptaker, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00078 for **conceptual review of a new three story single family residence with the first floor being approximately 3,847 square feet, the second floor being approximately 2,086 square feet with a third story element of approximately 180 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 700 square feet**. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1380 square feet, the second story being approximately 1,207 and an attached garage of approximately 736 square feet, (all to be demolished). The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.03 acre foot parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-100-014, located at **671 Buena Vista Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Jeff Shelton, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. The project looks great, but at the proposed size the structure would exceed the recommended Floor Area Ratio (FAR) by 1800 feet. The MBAR has been asked by the Montecito Planning Commission to stay close to the recommended FAR and therefore the project could not be supported at the proposed size.
2. The design is gorgeous; the tower is a unifying element.
3. The building's size needs to be pushed down to be more consistent with guidelines.

4. The design is very nice; could consider a home that exceeds the FAR by approximately 900 square feet. The tower is acceptable as an architectural element.
5. At 6100 square feet the proposed structure is three times the size of one neighboring house and twice as big as another. The concern regarding the project size is exacerbated by the proposed location adjacent to the northern property line.
6. The neighboring parcels are larger than this one, which adds to the concern about the scale of the structure.
7. As the 500 square foot painting studio could be proposed as an accessory structure, that additional square footage is acceptable as part of the primary structure.
8. In order to consider approving a structure exceeding the FAR, the MBAR will need to have better statistics on the home sizes in the neighborhood.
9. The MBAR has allowed overages of less than or equal to 10%.
10. In order to make the required findings, the MBAR needs information on how privacy and neighborhood compatibility will be handled.
11. Given the long quiet lines of the proposed home, it is possible that the structure would not disturb the neighbors, but the size relative to the recommended FAR needs to be dealt with.
12. The house at the proposed square footage might be acceptable, if there were no future accessory buildings.
13. The design is charming, and the siting is fine, but the project needs to match the neighborhood better.

The project received comments only (Spann absent, Palladini abstained). Project may return for preliminary after the Land Use Permit is received and with the approval of the planner.

7. 10BAR-00000-00075 Thayer New Single Family Dwelling 1515 Mimosa Lane
10CDP-00000-00031 (Brian Banks, Planner 568-2005) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Neumann Mendro Andrulaitis , architects for the owner, Thomas Thayer, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00075 for **conceptual review/preliminary approval of a new single story residence of approximately 2,602 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 480 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a 1,275 square foot single family residence (to be demolished). The proposed project will require approximately 100 cubic yards of cut and approximately 145 cubic yards of fill. The property is a .33 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-140-026, located at **1515 Mimosa Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.(Andy Neumann, Jeffrey Smith, John Kucharski, and Dave Mendro, appearing)

MBAR Comments:

1. Story poles are not needed.
2. The only concern would be the potential impact to the neighbor, due to the proximity to neighbors on both sides. However, the fact that no neighbors are raising concerns is good.
3. The hedges need to be maintained in a healthy and dense condition.

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Zilles and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Spann & Palladini absent) to grant conceptual review, preliminary approval of 10BAR-00000-00075.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member moved, seconded by Palladini, and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Spann & Eilchelberger absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, June 7, 2010 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 5:40 P.M.

