



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

MONTECITO BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW UNAPPROVED MINUTES Meeting of April 23, 2007

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

| | |
|--------------------|--|
| Marsha Zilles | Anthony Spann - Chair |
| Michele Michaelson | Don Nulty - Vice Chair |
| Raymond Ketzal | David Villalobos - MBAR Secretary |
| Sam Maphis | Julie Harris - Planner III |
| Peter Edwards | |

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:10 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

| | |
|--------------------|------------------|
| Marsha Zilles | |
| Michele Michaelson | |
| Raymond Ketzal | |
| Donald Nulty | Vice Chair |
| Anthony Spann | - Chair |
| Sam Maphis | |
| Peter Edwards | |
| David Villalobos | - MBAR Secretary |
| Allen Bell | - Planner III |

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:

J. Ritterbeck, Planner, Development Review

REPORTERS: None in attendance

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 15

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Nulty absent) to adopt the following changes to the agenda:

Item No. 5 – Sewall SFD Addition & Modification (06BAR-00000-00289) – Dropped from the Standard Agenda.

Item No. 8 – Kohansamad Demo/Rebuild SFD & Playroom (06BAR-00000-00216) – Continued to the meeting of May 7, 2007.

III. MINUTES: Ketzal moved, seconded by Michaelson and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to approve the Minutes of April 9, 2007, as revised.

IV. MONTECITO CONSENT AGENDA:

Selbert Garage Conversion

C-1. 07BAR-00000-00025 and Single Family Dwelling Remodel 705 Riven Rock Road
06LUP-00000-00873 (Jim Heaton, Planner 568-2516) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jennifer Foster, agent for the owners, James and Patricia Selbert, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00025 for **final approval on consent of an un-permitted remodel of the existing residence and conversion of the existing carport to a garage.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 11,004 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 517 square feet, detached garage of approximately 945 square feet, and cabana of approximately 152 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 3.4 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-130-014, located at **705 Riven Rock Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/26/07 and 3/12/07)

ACTION: Ketzler moved, seconded by Maphis, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant final approval on consent of 07BAR-00000-00025.

CONDITIONS:

- Plant an additional oak tree to soften the appearance of the front of the residence.
- Plant vines to green-up the wall along Para Grande Lane.

Note: These additions were hand-written on the approved landscape plan.

V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS: The MBAR will revise their visit to the Esrey project at 1398 Oak Creek Canyon Road (Lot 7), previously scheduled as an informal visit prior to today's hearing, to a formal site visit to be made at 2:00 p.m. before the start of the May 7, 2007 MBAR meeting. At the April 18, 2007 MPC meeting, staff presented the latest updates on MBAR application submittals. An MPC workshop/retreat was requested which will not be a joint meeting with the MBAR. However, there may be some items that the MBAR may want the MPC to discuss. The Chair will work with staff to forward a list of MBAR concerns for consideration.

VI. STAFF UPDATE: None.

STANDARD AGENDA:

FINAL APPROVAL

1. 01BAR-00000-00105 Rautiola Revised Landscaping 750 Riven Rock Road
02LUP-00002-00308 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jack Kiesel, architect for the owners, Mr. and Mrs. Norm Rautiola, to consider Case No. 01BAR-00000-00105 for **revised final approval of changes to previously approved landscaping.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 5,700 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 1,000 square feet. The property is a **8.91**-acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-090-006, located at **750 Riven Rock Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/03/03)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant revised final approval of 01BAR-00000-00105.

CONDITIONS:

- Map the existing plantings along the north and west property lines adjacent to the residence.

- Plant and map a hedge along the north and west property lines adjacent to the residence.
- Applicant shall submit the site plan with mapped existing plantings and new hedge to the planner for approval prior to issuance of the permit.

**2. 06BAR-00000-00048 Melograno Revisions 685 Cowles Road
06LUP-00001-00172 (Lisa Martin, Planner 568-2032) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Amy Taylor, architect for the owner, Richard Melograno, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00048 for **revised final approval of a trellis of approximately 223 square feet, a detached shop of approximately 294 square feet, an attached carport of approximately 342 square feet, and an attached storage building of approximately 111 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,882 square feet with an attached 2nd residential unit of approximately 492 square feet and a detached garage of 294 square feet. The proposed project will require no cut and approximately 5 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.14 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-180-044, located at **685 Cowles Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 3/20/06, 4/24/06, and 5/22/06)

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Michaelson, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant revised final approval of 06BAR-00000-00048.

**3. 05BAR-00000-00092 Cooper Revisions 759 Via Manana
06LUP-00001-00277 (Holly Bradbury, Planner 568-3577) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Tom Smith, architect for the owners Robert and Vanessa Cooper, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00092 for **revised final approval of a remodel to the guest wing, including conversion of rear loggia to approximately 92 square feet of habitable space, conversion of covered parking area to an attached garage of approximately 216 square feet, and revision of front balcony to a trellis.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 4,925 square feet. The property is a 0.95 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-090-028, located at **759 Via Manana** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/25/05, 6/05/06, and 1/22/07)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Ketznel, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant revised final approval of 05BAR-00000-00092.

**4. 06BAR-00000-00179 Arntz Revisions 1525 Las Tunas Road
06LUP-00001-00584 (Holly Bradbury, Planner 568-3577) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Brian Miller, agent for the owner, Meichelle Arntz, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00179 for **revised final approval of a reconfigured stair layout resulting in 500 square feet of additional area, revised front entry porch, revised grading, revised roof eave detail, and removal of 8 foot motor court wall.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 4,850 square feet with a detached garage of approximately 770 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 75 cubic yards of cut, approximately 269 cubic yards of fill, and approximately 194 cubic yards of import. The property is a 1.38 acre foot parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-110-036, located at **1525 Las Tunas Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 8/07/06)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 to grant revised final approval of 06BAR-00000-00179.

5. **06BAR-00000-00289** **Sewall Single Family Dwelling** **768 Ayala Lane**
Addition and Modification
06LUP-00000-01038 (Selena Buoni, Planner 568-2910) Ridgeline: N/A
06MOD-00000-00019

Request of Jock Sewall, owner, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00289 for **final approval of a second-story addition of approximately 996 square feet with corresponding removal of unpermitted rain shed, a trellis of approximately 1,690 square feet on existing roof deck, a screened porch of approximately 338 square feet, partial demolition and interior remodel of the existing guest house to reduce it to approximately 800 square feet and permit it as a guest house, and conversion of an existing carport/storage shed to a detached three-car garage and storage shed. Retaining walls of up to six feet in height are also proposed, to create the lower garden. The requested Modification would allow for the existing unpermitted carport and storage shed to encroach six feet into the side yard setback, and would allow for the existing unpermitted guest house to encroach nine feet into the front setback.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 2,500 square feet, unpermitted guest house of approximately 1,000 square feet, and unpermitted storage shed/carport of approximately 600 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 100 cubic yards of cut and approximately 100 cubic yards of fill. No oak trees are proposed for removal. The property is a 1.22 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-090-053, located at **768 Ayala Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 12/11/06, 12/18/06)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 (Nulty absent) to drop 06BAR-00000-00289 from the Standard Agenda. See Agenda Status Report.

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

6. **06BAR-00000-00304** **Schwartz Wall** **1727 Fernald Point Lane**
04CDH-00004-00007 (Julie Harris, Planner 568-3518) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Mark Schwartz, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00304 for **preliminary/final approval of a new plaster wall.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 7,800 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 832 square feet (addition under construction, existing portion historic and relocated, undergoing renovation) and storage/guesthouse of approximately 715 square feet (historic, relocated and undergoing renovation). The proposed project will require no cut and approximately 10 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.5 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-380-003, located at **1727 Fernald Point Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/08/07)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Zilles, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to 1 (Nulty recused) to grant preliminary and final approval of 06BAR-00000-00304.

CONDITIONS:

- Height of the wall shall not be greater than six feet as measured from natural grade.
- Wall shall be sloped (follow slope of natural grade), not stepped.
- Agent shall submit revised plans to Planning and Development planner for review and approval.

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Agent submitted revised plans for the wall, which he said would be six feet in height as measured from natural grade.

7. **07BAR-00000-00022 Eldred New Residence and Guest House 1437 S. Jameson Lane**
07CDH-00000-00006 (Jim Heaton, Planner 568-2516) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Anthony Spann, Harrison Design Associates, architect for the owner, David Eldred, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00022 for **preliminary/final approval of a new residence of approximately 4,732 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 1,286 square feet, guest house of approximately 800 square feet, pool, and associated landscaping.** The lot is currently vacant. The proposed project will require 100 cubic yards of cut and approximately 2,100 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 3.27 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-320-017, located at **1437 South Jameson Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/26/07)

ACTION: Zilles moved, seconded by Maphis, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to 1 (Spann recused) to grant preliminary and final approval of **07BAR-00000-00022.**

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Landscaping and color/materials look good.
- Lighting consists of path lights with 20 watt bulbs.

8. **06BAR-00000-00216 Kohansamad Demo/Rebuild Single Family Dwelling & Playroom/Workshop 744 Ashley Road**
06LUP-00000-00838 (Deborah Kramer, Planner 568-2021) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of John Watson, architect for the owners, Albert Kohansamad, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00216 for **preliminary approval of a new residence of approximately 4,449 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 799 square feet, and detached playroom/workshop of approximately 671 square feet.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,400 square feet (to be demolished). The proposed project will require approximately 193 cubic yards of cut and approximately 266 cubic yards of fill with 73 cubic yards imported. The property is a 1.1 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-120-061, located at **744 Ashley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 9/25/06, 11/13/06, and 3/12/07)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 6 to 0 to continue **06BAR-00000-00216** to the MBAR meeting of May 7, 2007. *See Agenda Status Report.*

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. **07BAR-00000-00063 Lawarre Single Family Dwelling Addition and Garages 1599 East Valley Road**
(no planner assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Ray Ketzal, Ketzal and Goodman, architect for the owner, William Lawarre, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00063 for **conceptual review of an addition of approximately 1,415 square feet (including partial demolition of approximately 814 square feet, for a net gain of approximately 601 square feet) to the existing residence, an attached 1-car garage of approximately 331 square feet, an attached 2-car garage of approximately 563 square feet, and an attached 3-car garage of approximately 946 square feet, and relocation of basement stairs.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: two-story residence of approximately 7,206 square feet, basement of approximately 1,080 square feet, detached 6-car garage of approximately 1,104 square feet (to be

demolished), and 2 pre-fabricated carports of approximately 640 total square feet (to be demolished). The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 2.1 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-220-060, located at **1599 East Valley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/09/07)

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Ketzler recused from discussion of this item. Applicant to return for preliminary. The following comments were made:

MBAR COMMENTS:

- One member noted that the house exceeds the recommended FAR.
- Parcel to the north will remain undeveloped; therefore the subject parcel appears larger than its actual size (2.1 acres). This helps offset concerns about square footage of the proposed house (FAR).
- Proposed addition extends across lot and motor court is large. Landscape plan should minimize hardscape and soften front of residence within the historic context of the setting.

**10. 05BAR-00000-00258 Lufkin Single Family Dwelling Addition and Remodel 135 Pomar Lane
05CDH-00000-00038 (Holly Bradbury, Planner 568-3577) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Jim Zimmerman, architect for the owners, Peter and Francie Lufkin, to consider Case No. 05BAR-00000-00258 for **further conceptual review of an addition to an existing residence, consisting of a first floor addition of approximately 346 square feet, a second floor addition of approximately 603 square feet, and a remodel of approximately 448 square feet. Also, a five foot wide and twenty-eight foot long bridge will be included as part of the project.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single family dwelling of approximately 2,815 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 497 square feet. The proposed project will require less than 50 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 0.52 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number **007-322-002**, located at **135 Pomar Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/21/05)

Project received further conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for preliminary. The following comments were made:

MBAR COMMENTS:

- MBAR only considered the bridge.
- Structural aspects are acceptable, but details need additional work.
- Incorporate details of residence into bridge.
- Add wood elements to the bridge. For example, use wood handrails, posts and caps.
- A combination of wood and wrought iron could work; such as large wood verticals combined with small wrought iron verticals.

**11. 07BAR-00000-00016 Jaeger Single Family Dwelling Addition 45 Humphrey Road
07CDH-00000-00004 (Selena Buoni, Planner 568-2910) Ridgeline: N/A**

Request of Tom Ochsner, architect for the owner, Jason Jaeger, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00016 for **further conceptual review of a residential addition of approximately 307 square feet (104 square foot entryway and 203 square foot bedroom/bath addition). The smaller existing storage shed will be removed as well as the portion of the larger shed that lies within the 10-foot sideyard setback.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,725 square feet and two detached storage sheds of 523 total square feet. The proposed project will require

approximately 20 cubic yards of cut and approximately 20 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.31 acre parcel zoned 15-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-341-010, located at **45 Humphrey Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/12/07)

Project received further conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for preliminary/final. The following comments were made:

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Planner should clarify that MBAR does not review residential second unit.
- Addition is low profile with wood; it goes with the character of the neighborhood.
- West side elevation has been cleaned up. Looks good.

| | | | |
|-----|---|---|--------------------------------|
| 12. | 07BAR-00000-00079 (no planner assigned) | Grassini Single Family Dwelling Addition | 1775 Fernald Point Lane |
| | | | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Ken Mineau, architect for the owners, Larry and Sharon Grassini, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00079 for **conceptual review of a first floor addition of approximately 235 square feet, second story addition of approximately 2,394 square feet, and basement addition of 400 square feet to the existing residence, and deck addition of approximately 108 square feet to the existing guesthouse.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 6,260 square feet with basement of approximately 200 square feet, cabana of approximately 360 square feet, detached garage of approximately 765 square feet, and guesthouse of approximately 743 square feet (located over existing detached garage). The proposed project will require approximately 24 cubic yards of cut and approximately 24 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.32 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-380-007, located at **1775 Fernald Point Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

MBAR COMMENTS:

- MBAR requested a site visit with story poles. In part, MBAR will consider the impact of the project on views seen from the beach.
- Owner needs to submit square footage study that compares the proposed house to nearby houses.
- Site plan needs to include the adjacent house to the east (Klink).
- Owner should submit photographs of the property as seen from the beach.
- Owner should submit an application for a Coastal Development Permit and then try to arrange a joint site visit with MBAR and the Montecito Planning Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- **John Klink** – Submitted written memo to MBAR. He opposed addition as proposed. It would block his views and affect his privacy and light. The proposed structure exceeds the recommended FAR.

| | | | |
|-----|---|--|--------------------------|
| 13. | 07BAR-00000-00028 07LUP-00000-00095 (J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509) | Dene Demo/New Single Family Dwelling and Garage | 416 Camphor Place |
| | | | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Dan Melville, agent for the owner, Louis Dene, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00028 for **further conceptual review and preliminary/final approval of a new**

two-story residence of approximately 2,987 square feet with a detached garage of approximately 441 square feet. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: single-story residence of approximately 1,274 square feet, detached garage of approximately 324 square feet, guest house of approximately 222 square feet, and laundry room structure of approximately 81 square feet (all to be demolished). The proposed project will require removal of up to 11 trees (including one 9-inch and one 13-inch oak) and approximately 40 cubic yards of cut and approximately 40 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.49 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-060-022, located at **416 Camphor Place** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/26/07 and 4/09/07)

Project received further conceptual review only. No action taken. Applicant to return for further conceptual review. The following comments were made:

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Front elevation turns its back on the street; the house has no relation to the street.
- Facade facing the street is too vertical. It looks like a tall two-story house not a second story element.
- Driveway brings vehicles too far into the property and results in significant hardscape.
- Reduce the second story mass in proportion to rest of the house in part by expanding the footprint of the house. Specifically, add more square footage on first floor and reduce square footage on second floor.
- Removing the driveway paving would allow the first floor to be expanded.
- Reduce height by lowering plate heights. Push the house down; press into the roofline.
- House must be compatible with the neighborhood. Consider returning with a drawing of the streetscape. Demonstrate how proposal fits into the neighborhood.
- MBAR would support a second story if it is properly designated and does not affect neighbors' privacy.
- Plans need to show any fencing and landscaping near pool.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- **Jeff Harding** (neighbor) – Concerned about second story. It is not in character with neighborhood and looks down into neighbors' yards.
- **Jerry Gutterman** (neighbor) – Size and scale are not compatible with the neighborhood. Second story compromises integrity of the street.
- **Bruce Glesby** (neighbor) – Asked questions about the existing hedge and the proposed rooflines and dormers.
- **Karen Anderson** (neighbor) – Concerned about second story. It would be prominent and would affect neighbors' privacy.
- One neighbor submitted an article from the *Montecito Journal*, titled "The Barkers of School House Road" (November 8 – 21, 2001).

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Nulty moved, seconded by Edwards, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, May 21, 2007 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:06 P.M.