

COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA



**MONTECITO
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of April 11, 2011**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Bill Palladini	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Sam Maphis	Sharon Foster	- MBAR Secretary
Derrick Eichelberger	Anne Almy	- Supervising Planner
Dave Mendro		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by the Vice Chair, Don Nulty, at 3.00 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Mendro
Bill Palladini
Donald Nulty - Vice Chair
Anthony Spann - Chair
Sam Maphis
Derrick Eichelberger
Sharon Foster - MBAR Secretary
Anne Almy - Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT:

Marsha Zilles

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: 20

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

- I. PUBLIC COMMENTS:** None
- II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT:** No changes were made to the agenda.
- I. III. MINUTES:** Palladini moved, seconded by Nulty and carried by a vote of 4-0-2 (Maphis, & Mendro abstained, Zilles absent) to approve the Minutes of March 28, 2011.
- V. MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:** None
- VI. STAFF UPDATE:** Anne Almy gave a briefing on discussion topics from the Joint Chairs meeting of April 11, 2011.

STANDARD AGENDA:

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|------------------------------|
| 1. | Crane School
Revised Master Plan | 1795 San Leandro Lane |
| 09BAR-00000-00182 | (Alex Tuttle Planner 884-6844) | Ridgeline: N/A |
| 09CUP-00000-00042 | | |

Request of Suzanne Elledge, agent for the owners, Crane School, to consider Case No. 09BAR-00000-00182 for **preliminary/final approval of a proposed 39,985 square feet of new development including additions to existing buildings and the construction of six new buildings. The project also includes a reconfigured parking lot, playfields and a comprehensive landscape plan.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: includes 15 buildings totaling approximately 31,720 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 2,589 cubic yards of cut and approximately 2,589 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 11 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-340-028, 007-340-039, 007-340-040 located at **1795 San Leandro** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/30/09) (Appearance by: Ken Radtkey)

MBAR Comments:

1. Very sensitive design.
2. The courtyards occurring throughout the campus are a strong design element.
3. The design approach to the new gym, i.e., bunkering, use of flat roof and green wall, and retention of existing trees, is an acceptable solution.

ACTION: Eichelberger moved, seconded by Palladini and carried by a vote of 5-0-1 (Spann abstained & Zilles absent) to grant preliminary/final approval of 09BAR-00000-00182 with the following condition:

Ensure the moonlights are hung low enough and have a steep enough cut off to address the concern of glare from these lights adversely affecting night time drivers along San Leandro.

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|------------------------------|
| 2. | Crane Country Day School Kindergarten Demo/Rebuild
and Site Improvements | 1795 San Leandro Lane |
| 10BAR-00000-00206 | (Alex Tuttle, Planner 884-6844) | Ridgeline: N/A |
| 10CDP-00000-00015 | | |

Request of Ken Radtkey, architect for the owners, Crane Country Day School, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00206 for **preliminary/final approval of the construction of a new Kindergarten building of approximately 1, 251 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: Crane Country Day School of approximately 31,720 square feet & Kindergarten building of approximately 836 square feet. The existing Kindergarten building will be demolished. The proposed project will require less than 25 cubic yards of cut and less than 25 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 3.77 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-340-028, located at **1795 San Leandro Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 1/10/11) (Appearance by: Ken Radtkey)

MBAR Comments:

1. Project received preliminary and final approvals with the following comments:
2. Appreciate reorientation of building to move the active outdoor learning area to face the interior of the campus.
3. Nice indoor/outdoor feel; the concept of having the patio level with the lawn is very thoughtful.
4. Design works well with the rest of the campus.

patio area with new pool and retaining walls of 6 feet, new motor court with retaining wall of 8 feet at the rear of the property. The project includes an exterior remodel from wood siding to plaster and stone, and a new tile roof. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 257 square feet, the second floor being approximately 2,714 square feet and an attached garage of approximately 483 square feet. The proposed project approximately 250 cubic yards of cut and approximately 250 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.88 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-060-012, located at **965 Brooktree Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 3/28/11)(Appearance by: Tom Smith & Rosa Andretti)

MBAR Comments:

1. Appreciate the change to the location and design of the retaining wall in the rear yard; design improvement leaves the majority of the rear yard untouched.
2. Appreciate the design change which places two shorter retaining walls at the pool as opposed to the previously proposed single taller retaining wall; design improvement diminishes apparent height of area being retained.
3. Delineate infinity edge at pool on plans.
4. Locate pool equipment on plans.
5. Concern with faux rock/plaster concept; this will need to be done very carefully to be successful; return with details for final review.
6. Rocks need to integrate throughout.
7. Installation of trees in front yard may require tree wells given slope; restudy.
8. *Ficus nitida* hedging is too formal and too bright green in its proposed edging application. Replace *Ficus* with a *Prunus* or *Laurus* hedging.

ACTION: Palladini moved, seconded by Eichelberger and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Zilles absent) to grant preliminary approval of 11BAR-00000-00029. Project may return for final on consent.

5.	10BAR-00000-00143	Booth New Single Family Dwelling & Garage	1795 Fernald Point Lane
	11CDH-00000-00009	(J. Ritterbeck, Planner 568-3509)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Jennifer Foster, agent for the owner, Loren Booth, to consider Case No. 10BAR-00000-00143 for **further conceptual review of a new two story single family dwelling with the first floor being approximately 1,887 square feet and the second floor being approximately 854 square feet and a detached garage of approximately 483 square feet. The project is also for Preliminary approval of the proposed 1'-2" Modification to the required 5-foot [northern] side setback to reduce it to 3'-10"**. The house has been moved back towards the north in order to maximize the distance between the proposed new SFD and the existing SFD of the southern neighbor. The parcel is currently developed with an in-ground swimming pool only, but received prior approval for construction of a new 2,606 sq. ft. SFD and 400 sq. ft. garage via 04CDH-00000-00042, which is still a valid permit. The proposed project will require approximately 50 cubic yards of cut and approximately 220 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 0.27-acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-380-030, located at **1795 Fernald Point Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 10/11/10, 12/6/10, 3/14/11) (Appearance by: Jennifer Foster, Loren Booth, Andy Nueman, Mary Andrulaitis), Amy Blakemore)

Public Comment:

John Klink

MBAR Comments:

1. **The Modification received preliminary approval with the finding that the modification results in better design. The CDH received conceptual review only.**
2. **One member of the Board is opposed to the project on the basis that the architectural design is too stark; prefers the previously approved design.**
3. **The majority of the Board supported the following comments:**
4. **Property is encumbered by a view easement on the south and a flood plain on the north and is narrow and small; very challenging site.**
5. **The project is just right and the applicant has compromised successfully; good balance orienting and massing the house to respect the Klink's (neighbor) views and privacy. The massing and siting of the proposed house has been modified to allow greater views for the Klink's above and beyond the view easement negotiated with the sale of the lot. The Modification allows the house to be sited allowing the Klink's as much side yard distance as possible.**
6. **There are primary views from the Klink's house south to the ocean and there are secondary views to the east and west across neighboring parcels. The proposed project has protected primary views and to the extent reasonable, secondary views as well.**
7. **The site visit confirmed that moving the house or further reorganizing the massing would not benefit the Klink's ocean views from their rear bedroom, which in any case, predominantly has mountain views. Moreover, the ocean view from this bedroom is a secondary view and therefore does not merit absolute protection.**
8. **Appreciate that the previously proposed boundary wall has been eliminated in favor of four foot to six foot chain link fencing buried in hedging.**
9. **The architecture is a bit severe; landscaping as proposed is very important to the success of the proposed new house, softening the architecture. Because the proposed new house is associated with the existing house to the east, the design, mirroring the existing house, is acceptable.**

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Maphis and carried by a vote of 4-0 (Eichelberger, Mendro abstained & Zilles absent) to grant preliminary approval of the modification.

The residence portion of the Project received comments only. The project will return to MBAR after it is heard by the Montecito Planning Commission. (Eichelberger, Mendro abstained, Spann opposed & Zilles absent)

6.	Doty Single Family Dwelling	
11BAR-00000-00036	Second Story Addition and Remodel	770 San Ysidro Lane
	(No Planner Assigned)	Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Patrick Marr, architect for the owners, Stephen & Lori Doty, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00036 for **conceptual review a second story addition to an existing single story dwelling of approximately 1,183 square feet and remodel to the existing residence.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a single story family dwelling of approximately 5,439 (106 square feet to be removed) a basement of approximately 204 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 1,174 and a guesthouse of approximately 930 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.70 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-150-028, located at **770 San Ysidro Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (**Appearance by: Patrick Marr, Stephen Doty**)

MBAR Comments:

1. **The proposed addition puts the house at 26% over the recommended FAR. With the proposed addition, the house would be the largest in the area. MBAR generally will tolerate only a maximum 10% over the recommended FAR. Redesign to reduce square footage.**
2. **MBAR agrees that the house as it currently stands is disorganized and lacks cohesion; design problem is to resolve this lack of design cohesion while achieving compatibility with the neighborhood in respect to size, bulk and scale. New roof forms are unsuccessful in creating greater cohesion; restudy.**
3. **Need to show neighboring homes and significant vegetation within 25 feet of the property lines. Even at 10% over the recommended FAR, the house will need to be well screened from the neighbors.**
4. **Style of home is in question; would like to know early on if architectural details will match existing or not. Details will be important.**

Project received comments only. The project should submit an application for a Land Use Permit and return for further conceptual review. Zilles was absent from the discussion.

7. **11BAR-00000-00038** 281 Hot Springs, LLC
Roof, Landscape and Driveway Changes 281 Hot Springs Road
11LUP-00000-00119 (Brian Banks, Planner 568-3559) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owners, 281 Hot Springs, LLC, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00038 for **conceptual review of a new driveway and entry gates, existing entry walls to be raised from 6 feet to 8 feet, a new tennis court to replace the existing sport court, replace existing pool with a new configuration, a new gable roof on the master bathroom and new window changes and remove previously approved doors to the media room.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story residence of approximately 5275 square feet total, a detached garage of approximately 486 square feet (to be demolished) an detached accessory structure of approximately 800 square feet (to be demolished), a kitchen addition of approximately 104 square feet, mud room addition of approximately 157 square feet and family room of approximately 396 square feet. . The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 1.75 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-070-008, located at **281 Hot Springs Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Appearance by: Robert Foley, Bill Brunsky

Public Comment:
Hugh Merrill

MBAR Comments:

1. **OK with project except some concern about gable roof form over master bath; restudy.**
2. **Return for preliminary/final reviews on consent.**

Project received comments only. The project may return for preliminary/final approval on consent with the approval of the planner. Zilles was absent from the discussion, Nulty abstained.

8. **11BAR-00000-00035** Moller/Von Summer Single Family Dwelling
Second Floor Addition and New Garage 280 Las Entradas Drive
(No Planner Assigned) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owners, Betsy Von Summer & John Moller, to consider Case No. 11BAR-00000-00035 for **conceptual review of an addition to a two story single family dwelling, with the first floor being of approximately 2,426 square feet the second floor being 2,625 square feet and a new 3 car attached garage of approximately 742 square feet, with living space about and enclosure of existing loggia.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: a two story single family

dwelling with the first floor being approximately 3,777 square feet (1,841 square feet to be demolished), the second floor being approximately 2,386 square feet, an attached garage of approximately 519 square feet (to be converted into a gym) a detached garage of approximately 512 square feet (to be demolished), a guesthouse of approximately 439 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 60 cubic yards of cut and approximately 60 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 3.5 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-500-025, located at **280 Las Entradas Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (**Appearance by Robert Foley**)

MBAR Comments:

- 1. Conceptually competent. Style is nice.**
- 2. Project is 15% over the recommended FAR. In this neighborhood overages of 15-20% are not unusual; return with FAR study of the neighborhood. The project will ultimately need story poles and a site visit to definitively confirm appropriateness of size, bulk, scale and massing.**

Project received comments only. The project can return for further conceptual/ preliminary approval with a landscape plan after having reviewed plans with the Las Entradas HOA and after having submitted an application for a Land Use Permit. Nulty abstained from the discussion and Zilles absent.

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Eichelberger moved, seconded by Mendro, and carried by a vote of 4 to 0 (Nulty, Zilles and Maphis absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, April 25, 2011 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:30 P.M.