



COUNTY OF SANTA BARBARA

**MONTECITO
BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW
APPROVED MINUTES
Meeting of March 24, 2008**

Santa Barbara County
Planning Commission Hearing Room
Engineering Building, Room 17
123 East Anapamu Street
Santa Barbara, California 93101
(805) 568-2000

Marsha Zilles	Anthony Spann	- Chair
Michele Michaelson	Don Nulty	- Vice Chair
Raymond Ketzell	Jason Moore	- MBAR Secretary
Sam Maphis	June Pujo	- Supervising Planner
Peter Edwards		

The regular meeting of the Santa Barbara County Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee was called to order by Chair, Anthony Spann, at 3:06 P.M., in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Anthony Spann	- Chair
Marsha Zilles	
Michele Michaelson	
Raymond Ketzell	
Donald Nulty	- Vice Chair
Sam Maphis	
Peter Edwards	
Jason Moore	- MBAR Secretary
Peter Imhof	- Supervising Planner

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

STAFF PRESENT:

Allen Bell, Planner, Development Review South
Eric Gage, Planner, Development Review South
Alex Tuttle, Planner, Development Review South

REPORTERS: None in attendance.

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 4.

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA:

I. PUBLIC COMMENT:

II. AGENDA STATUS REPORT: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5 to 0 (Nulty and Maphis absent) to adopt the following changes to the agenda:

Item No. C-1 – So.Cal. Edison Comm. Facility (07BAR-00000-00286) – Staff requesting continuance to 4/21/08 meeting.
Item No. 1 – Shirokow SFD Addition (07BAR-00000-00277) – Dropped from the agenda.

Item No. 4 – Nigro New SFD/Guest House/Gatehouse/Shed (07BAR-00000-00317) – Staff requesting continuance to 4/07/08 meeting.

Item No. 5 – Schnell SFD Demo/Rebuild (07BAR-00000-00289) – Applicant requesting continuance to 4/07/08 meeting.

III. **MINUTES:** Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Spann abstain) to approve the MBAR Minutes of March 10, 2008 with revisions.

IV. **MONTECITO CONSENT AGENDA:**

C-1. 07BAR-00000-00286 07CUP-00000-00074	Southern California Edison Communications Facility (Heather Allen, Planner 568-2043)	Gibraltar Rd & Mountain Dr Ridgeline: N/A
--	--	---

Request of Robert McCormick, agent for the owners, Clearwire Wireless, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00286 for **preliminary/final on consent of an installation of an approximate 50 square foot wireless communications facility.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: one 88 foot high-power transmission tower with a footprint of approximately 256 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 5.42 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-020-003, located at **Gibraltar Road and Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/07 and 2/25/08.)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Nulty and Maphis absent) to continue 07BAR-00000-00286 to the MBAR meeting of April 21, 2008. See *Agenda Status Report*.

V. **MBAR MEMBERS INFORMATIONAL BRIEFINGS:** None.

VI. **STAFF UPDATE:** Pujo provided feedback on the parcel history questions raised by Bill Palladini, Montecito Association. The permit history for 2300 Bella Vista and 945 Park Lane were reviewed, particularly as related to construction of perimeter walls. The approved project descriptions specified the scope of the permit approvals, including wall length and height. Construction is required to comply with the project description, approved plans and conditions of approval.

STANDARD AGENDA:

FINAL APPROVAL

1. 07BAR-00000-00277 07LUP-00000-00829	Shirokow Single Family Dwelling Additions (Eric Gage, Planner 568-2002)	1413 Schoolhouse Road Ridgeline: N/A
--	---	--

Request of Laura Kay Dunbar, architect for the owner, Katya Shirokow, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00277 for **final approval of the conversion of an existing garage to living space for a first floor addition of approximately 707 square feet, a second floor addition of approximately 408 square feet to the existing residence, an approximately 506 square foot new garage and driveway repaving, and a new cabana of approximately 799 square feet.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 2,456 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 540 square feet, and tennis court. The proposed project will require approximately 38 cubic yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1.27 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-080-021, located at **1413 Schoolhouse Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/05/07 and 2/11/08.)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Nulty and Maphis absent) to continue 07BAR-00000-00277 to the MBAR meeting of April 21, 2008. See *Agenda Status Report*.

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

- | | | |
|----|---|----------------------------|
| 2. | Terzian Demolition, SFD Replacement
and Cabana Remodel | 1491 Edgecliff Lane |
| | 06BAR-00000-00018
05CDH-00000-00026 (Allen Bell, Planner 569-2033) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of James Macari, architect for the owner, Nina Terzian, to consider Case No. 06BAR-00000-00018 for **preliminary/final approval of the demolition of an existing residence and accessory structures, and the construction of a new residence of approximately 3,431 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 658 square feet, detached recreation room of approximately 791 square feet and pool and related accessory structures.** The structures to be demolished on the parcel include: residence of approximately 924 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 442 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 260 yards of grading. Several trees will be removed. The project does not affect the existing cabana in the southwest corner of the property. The property is a 0.59 acre (25,707 square feet) parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-360-005, located at **1491 Edgecliff Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/06/06, 4/24/06 and 10/23/06.)

ACTION: Nulty moved, seconded by Michaelson, and carried by a vote of 7-0 to grant preliminary approval of 06BAR-00000-00018.

MBAR COMMENT:

- Project may return for final approval on consent.

- | | | |
|----|--|-----------------------|
| 3. | Clark SFD Demo/Rebuild | 1136 Hill Road |
| | 07BAR-00000-00291
07CDP-00000-00116 (Eric Gage, Planner 568-2002) | Ridgeline: N/A |

Request of Larry Clark, architect for the owner, Martha Jeanette Clark, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00291 for **preliminary/final approval of a new one-story residence of approximately 2,850 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 696 square feet, and the demolition of the existing residence and garage.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,116 square feet and an attached two-car garage of approximately 420 square feet. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 0.42 acre parcel zoned 20-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-351-007, located at **1136 Hill Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/07.)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Maphis, and carried by a vote of 7-0 to grant preliminary/final approval of 07BAR-00000-00291.

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Approval is subject to and must include low intensity lighting condition.

4. **07BAR-00000-00317** **Nigro New SFD/Guest House/
Gatehouse/Shed** **1664 East Valley Road**
07LUP-00000-00873 (Eric Gage, Planner 568-2002) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Michael Stroh, architect for the owner, James Nigro, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00317 for **preliminary/final approval of a new two-story residence of approximately 7,380 square feet (proposed 3,615 square foot first floor and 3,765 square foot second floor) with a 2,131 square foot basement, attached and detached garages totaling approximately 902 square feet; a guest house of approximately 766 square feet; a gatehouse of approximately 87 square feet; and a gardener shed of approximately 160 square feet.** There are currently no existing structures on the parcel. The proposed project will require approximately 350 cubic yards of cut and 350 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 3.06 acre parcel zoned 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-120-045, located at **1664 East Valley Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 12/17/07, 1/28/08 and 2/25/08.)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Nulty and Maphis absent) to continue 07BAR-00000-00317 to the MBAR meeting of April 21, 2008. See *Agenda Status Report*.

5. **07BAR-00000-00289** **Schnell SFD Demo/Rebuild** **700 East Mountain Drive**
07LUP-00000-00851 (Sarah Clark, Planner 568-2059) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Michael Stroh, architect for the owners, Robert and Renee Schnell, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00289 for **preliminary approval of a new one-story residence of approximately 4,204 square feet, a basement of approximately 1,790 square feet with an attached garage of approximately 795 square feet; a detached cabana of approximately 748 square feet; and the demolition of the existing residence, guesthouse and garage.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 3,213 square feet, detached garage of approximately 318 square feet and a detached guesthouse of approximately 543 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 3,200 cubic yards of cut and fill. The property is a 1.22 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 013-040-009, located at **700 East Mountain Drive** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/07, 12/17/07 and 2/25/08.)

ACTION: Michaelson moved, seconded by Edwards and carried by a vote of 5-0 (Nulty and Maphis absent) to continue 07BAR-00000-00289 to the MBAR meeting of April 21, 2008. See *Agenda Status Report*.

6. **07BAR-00000-00296** **Morgan SFD As-Built Additions,
Den & Stairs** **1037 Monte Cristo Lane**
07CDP-00000-00120 (Eric Gage, Planner 568-2002) Ridgeline: N/A

Request of Arthur Morgan, agent for the owner, Alicia Morgan, to consider Case No. 07BAR-00000-00296 for **preliminary approval of as-built additions, that include an approximately 90 square foot dining room addition, an approximately 32 square foot entry tower, an approximately 4 square foot hallway and door addition, an approximately 183 square foot enclosed patio (at the south end of the dwelling), an approximately 48 square foot remodel at the south end of the dwelling, an approximately 87 square foot tile roof, a spiral stair case at atrium, an approximately 851 square foot new floor area and bath at second floor, an approximately 79 square foot art room addition, an approximately 95 square foot tower, an approximately 122 square foot trellis, an arched wall, and parapet walls on east and west side of dwelling at second floor, to an existing single family dwelling and an approximately 87 square foot new stairs, an approximately 205 square foot den and an approximately 56 square foot deck addition.** The following

structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 2,484 square feet, an approximately 980 square foot detached guesthouse and an approximately 1,146 square foot detached garage. The proposed project will not require grading. The property is a 11,761 square foot parcel zoned 7-R-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 009-282-021, located at **1037 Monte Cristo Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 11/19/07.)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Michaelson, and carried by a vote of 7-0 to grant preliminary approval of 07BAR-00000-00296.

MBAR COMMENT:

- Project may return for final approval on consent.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

7.	08BAR-00000-00014	Deansgrange Trust New SFD & Garage	592 Picacho Lane Ridgeline: N/A
-----------	--------------------------	---	---

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Deansgrange Trust, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00014 for **conceptual review of new residence of approximately 3,594 square foot, an approximately 500 square foot new garage and a new tennis court.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: residence of approximately 1,846 square feet and a barn of approximately 1,930 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 300 cubic yards of cut and approximately 300 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.02 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-140-031, located at **592 Picacho Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Nulty recused himself. Applicant may return for preliminary.

MBAR COMMENTS:

- Positive comments regarding overall site design on all three adjacent lots.
- Grading, as proposed, would cross property line; study grading and drainage (grading and drainage plan needs to be prepared by a civil engineer).
- Screening/landscaping at property lines important.
- Overall favorable opinion on architecture; precedent exists for Cape Dutch style; MBAR likes thatch roof concept and materials.
- Erect story poles for two-story portion of residence; positive comments regarding building massing.
- Montecito Fire District should review plans before project returns to MBAR.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Beverly Ogden
- Bill Palladini

8.	08BAR-00000-00015	Deansgrange Trust New SFD/Demo	588 Picacho Lane Ridgeline: N/A
-----------	--------------------------	---	---

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Deansgrange Trust, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00015 for **conceptual review of new residence of approximately 8,080 square foot with an attached garage of approximately 748 square feet, an approximately**

990 square foot basement, a workshop of approximately 324 square feet, a cabana of approximately 800 square feet and a new swimming pool. The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 4,800 square feet (to be demolished), a garage of approximately 873 square feet and a swimming pool. The proposed project will require approximately 700 cubic yards of cut and approximately 700 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 2.42 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-140-030 and 011-140-032 (to be merged), located at **588 Picacho Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Nulty recused himself. Applicant may return for preliminary.

MBAR COMMENTS:

- **Siting ok.**
- **Story poles for second story portion required.**
- **Landscape plan (including driveway) needed; landscaping should effectively screen house without blocking mountain views.**
- **MBAR concerned that project exceeds allowable FAR by 20 percent; majority of MBAR could support project if FAR is reduced below 20 percent.**
- **Show gates on plans.**
- **Preliminary grading and drainage plan prepared by a civil engineer required.**
- **Resolve concerns about cross-property line grading prior to preliminary.**
- **Amount of grading, including placement of 8 feet of fill, appears excessive.**
- **Montecito Fire District should review plans before project returns.**

9.	08BAR-00000-00016	Deansgrange Trust New SFD/Demo	588 Picacho Lane Ridgeline: N/A
-----------	--------------------------	---	---

Request of Don Nulty, architect for the owner, Deansgrange Trust, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00016 for **conceptual review of new residence of approximately 2,670 square foot and an approximately 521 square foot new garage.** The following structure currently exists on the parcel: cottage of approximately 592 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 300 cubic yards of cut and approximately 300 cubic yards of fill. The property is a 1.02 acre parcel zoned 3-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 011-140-029, located at **588 Picacho Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District.

Project received conceptual review only. No action taken. Nulty recused himself. Applicant may return for preliminary.

MBAR COMMENTS:

- **Site poles not needed.**
- **Landscape, grading/drainage plans needed prior to preliminary approval.**
- **Grading required to enlarge pond may be excessive.**
- **Siting, architecture and massing acceptable.**

10.	08BAR-00000-00002	Park Additions	647 Park Lane Ridgeline: N/A
------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	--

Request of Kent Mixon, architect for the owners, Francoise and Jim Park, to consider Case No. 08BAR-00000-00002 for **conceptual review of an approximately 534 square foot addition to an existing residence.** The following structures currently exist on the parcel: residence of approximately 6,406 square feet. The proposed project will require approximately 30 cubic

yards of cut and no fill. The property is a 1.48 acre parcel zoned 1-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 007-120-012, located at **647 Park Lane** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 2/25/08.)

ACTION: Maphis moved, seconded by Nulty, and carried by a vote of 7-0 to continue 08BAR-00000-00002 to a future MBAR hearing.

PRELIMINARY APPROVAL

11.	01BAR-00000-00272	Westmont College – Phase 1 Development of Campus Master Plan	955 La Paz Road
	90-CP-096 RV01	(Alex Tuttle, Planner 884-6844)	Ridgeline: Urban
	07LUP-00000-00821		

Request of Laurel Perez, agent for the owner, Westmont College, to consider Case No. 01BAR-00000-00272 for **preliminary approval of all Phase I improvements of the Westmont College Campus Master Plan (Phase I improvements include construction of the new campus entrance and perimeter drive, construction of approximately 150,123 gross square feet of buildings, and re-orientation of the baseball field and track and infield)**. Fifty-two structures currently exist on the campus providing facilities for academic, athletic, administration, maintenance/storage, and residential functions totaling approximately 378,508 gross square feet. The property 111 acres zoned 1-E-1 and 2-E-1 and shown as Assessor's Parcel Numbers 013-050-018, 013-060-004, -005, -006, 013-080-004, -005, -007, 013-090-004, and -041, located at **955 La Paz Road** in the Montecito area, First Supervisorial District. (Continued from 4/19/02, 8/23/04, 4/24/06, 5/08/06, 5/22/06, 5/30/06, 9/11/06, 9/25/06, 12/03/07, 1/07/08, 2/11/08 and 2/25/08.)

ACTION: Edwards moved, seconded by Nulty, and carried by a vote of 6-0 (Ketznel recused) to continue 01BAR-00000-00272 to a future MBAR hearing.

MBAR COMMENTS:

Chapel

- Long overhang is awkward; restudy overhangs.
- Building design still appears to be driven by interior, which will be exciting. However, some exterior lines are rather static; restudy roof lines and long, unbroken forms.
- Stucco/stone composition should be clarified; materials must work together.
- Steepness of roof makes building out of scale; roof reads almost as a wall because of steepness.
- Dual glazing with stained glass inside will not be visible as stained glass from outside building.
- Reversal of smaller, inset window recessing encouraged.
- Cross extending to ground is an interesting detail; consider glass as material?
- Chapel is ready for Preliminary Review.

Parking/Landscaping

- Play off heights with some taller trees; larger diameter trees on mounded, elevated areas for a more immediate effect.
- Keep site entrance lower key, use only ground mounted lights (none on posts).

Sportsfield/Track

- Address landscaping along perimeter fencing around track.

- **Plans and elevations required for all accessory structures, including track storage and Porter Hall, prior to preliminary.**
- **Sportsfield/Track is ready for Preliminary Review.**

Baseball Diamond

- **50 foot screening fence for foul balls – neighbors should be made aware, since not mentioned at PC hearing.**
- **Telescoping fencing as option to protect observatory during games?**
- **Baseball diamond is ready for Preliminary Review.**

Adams & Winter

- **Railings must work with buildings and with each other; at present there are three different styles.**
- **Include true scale and railing details.**
- **Avoid “clunkiness.”**

General

- **Preliminary sign program, including lighting, needed before preliminary approval.**

There being no further business to come before the Montecito Board of Architectural Review Committee, Committee Member Edwards moved, seconded by Zilles, and carried by a vote of 7 to 0 that the meeting be adjourned until 3:00 P.M. on Monday, April 7, 2008 in the Santa Barbara County Engineering Building, Room 17, 123 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

Meeting adjourned at 6:33 P.M.